

James Madison University

JMU Scholarly Commons

Masters Theses, 2020-current

The Graduate School

5-6-2021

Immigration After the Great Famine: A Case Study of the Passengers of the S.S. Canadian

Erin Kelly

Follow this and additional works at: <https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/masters202029>



Part of the [Digital Humanities Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kelly, Erin, "Immigration After the Great Famine: A Case Study of the Passengers of the S.S. Canadian" (2021). *Masters Theses, 2020-current*. 98.

<https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/masters202029/98>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the The Graduate School at JMU Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Masters Theses, 2020-current by an authorized administrator of JMU Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact dc_admin@jmu.edu.

Immigration After the Great Famine: A Case Study of the Passengers of the S.S.
Canadian

Erin Kelly

A thesis submitted to the Graduate Faculty of

JAMES MADISON UNIVERSITY

In

Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

for the Degree of

Master of Arts

Department of History

May 2021

FACULTY COMMITTEE:

Committee Chair: Evan Friss

Committee Members/ Readers:

Gabrielle Lanier

Kevin Borg

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	iii
Virtual Exhibit Link	v
I. Introduction	1
II. The Process	5
III. The Research.....	20
Works Cited	54

Abstract

From 1879 to 1881 Western Ireland suffered a famine that left one million people in a state of destitution. To assist the starving, impoverished farming communities that were scattered across the region English Quaker and philanthropist James Hack Tuke successfully pitched the Tuke Emigration Scheme to the UK government in 1882, lasting through 1884. While historians of Irish immigration have recently begun to research famines other than the Great Famine, very few have delved more deeply into this particular scheme. Of those who have, including Christine Kinnealy and Gerard Moran, analysis has been limited to the perspective of Ireland and thus far only the unpublished research of Margaret Lynch of Cleveland, Ohio's Irish American Archives Society has delved into the American view of the scheme. While the mission and reports of Tuke and his governmental committee are well documented, investigating the reality of immigrant experiences in the United States requires more effort. Using a database of state and federal biographical records in tandem with Tuke's sailing manifests, statistical analysis of the status of immigrants can be completed. This research paper along with a complementary ArcGIS Cascade virtual exhibit focuses on one sailing of the Tuke Emigration Scheme, that of the S.S. Canadian in April 1884, uses such analysis to demonstrate that while the scheme was certainly successful in establishing new connections and trends in four particular regions of the United States in later Irish-American immigration as driven by Tuke, in reality it only aligned with Tuke's more specific vision to a degree. Through a combination of passenger data, the writings of Tuke and his committee, local historical records of Cleveland, Ohio; the Pennsylvania

coal mining region; western states; and Holyoke, Massachusetts, and additional source material, the impact and realities of Tuke's scheme in the United States is revealed.

Link to Virtual Exhibit

<https://jmu.maps.arcgis.com/apps/Cascade/index.html?appid=96eef6bcb1e443249c942a5d146b61c>

I. Introduction

Irish famine studies is by no means a new historical subfield, nor is Irish immigration studies, but there is still much research to be done in both. Namely, the driving focus in each field has been the impact of the Great Famine (1845-52) on the state of Ireland and on the ethnic and cultural makeup of the United States. But as of late, more and more attention is being given to the lesser Irish famines that resulted in smaller waves of emigration. In June of 2019, Quinnipiac University, home to Ireland's Great Hunger Institute and the largest collection of famine artwork, hosted a conference entitled *Famines in Ireland Before 1845 and After 1852* which addressed the long shadow cast over Irish history by the Great Famine.¹ In reality, Ireland had been intermittently disturbed by famine crises dating back to the push of the natives out of Ulster toward the rocky western coast at the hands of the British in the 16th and 17th centuries and continuing through the early 20th century. One such lesser famine battered the western counties of Ireland throughout the majority of counties Donegal, Mayo, and Galway from 1879-1881. Englishman and Quaker James H. Tuke wrote extensively about the lack of relief or aid provided to these regions by the British government in a series of pamphlets he released in the early years of the famine. He in turn created an emigration scheme, known as the Tuke Emigration Scheme, to fund the emigration of impoverished western Irish families to North America via fifteen sailings throughout 1883 and 1884.

Due to the wide array of lesser famines and the relative few historians covering them, each particular lesser famine has undergone very little investigation and the famine

¹ "Irish Famines before 1845 and after 1852," Academic Conference, Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT: (June 12, 2019).

of 1879-1881 and subsequently Tuke's scheme is no different. While the two scholars Gerard Moran and Christine Kinealy have investigated this particular scheme from the perspective of the Irish, only recently and on a very minor scale have any historians begun to examine the impact of the scheme on the American side.² A local historian of Cleveland's Irish community, Dr. Margaret Lynch, director of the city's Irish American Archive Society, has initiated research into the lives of these immigrants. Thus far, her unpublished research has mostly examined the trajectory of the immigrants' lives with an eye towards genealogical research as she initially partnered with Ionad Deirbhile, a heritage center located in Blacksod Bay, County Mayo.³ This center features an exhibition on assisted emigration from the region via Tuke's scheme. Rosemarie Geraghty, also of the center, completed the first transcriptions of the fifteen departure manifests which have been made available on blacksodbayemigration.ie.⁴ This site is dedicated to descendants of the scheme and serves as a space for them to share family history and photos, but does not serve to further the scholarship on the wave of immigration. Therefore, with the help of student interns, Dr. Lynch has begun to accrue United States Census data and other records on the Tuke immigrants to determine their individual fates and the larger immigration trends of this group. At the previously mentioned 2019 Quinnipiac conference, Dr. Lynch presented her findings thus far,

² For more information on their joint and independent research, explore Gerard Moran and Christine Kinealy's *Irish Hunger and Migration: Myth, Memory and Memorialization*, "*Fallen Leaves of Humanity*": *Famines in Ireland Before and After the Great*, and "Escape from Hunger: The Trials and Tribulations of the Irish State-Aided Emigrants in North America in the 1880s."

³ CFID, Bainisteoir, "Ionad Deirbhile Visitor Centre, Eachleim, Blacksod, Co. Mayo," <http://ionaddeirbhile.ie/>

⁴ "Blacksod Sailings," <http://www.blacksodbayemigration.ie/>

revealing that passengers were disproportionately destined for the southern Pennsylvania coal region; Cleveland, Ohio; Holyoke, Massachusetts; and select rural western towns.⁵

The emigration scheme was at first entirely privately funded by Tuke who was quite involved in both rolling out the scheme and reporting on its impact. In total, he published over 200 pages of private correspondence, public pamphlets, hand drawn maps and diagrams, and instructions regarding his scheme, all of which were anthologized by the Tuke Committee. This committee was established in 1882 to incorporate Tuke's scheme into the national government's relief program and to better administer aid and efforts to the regions that needed it most.⁶ Following the end of the scheme in 1884, Tuke kept in touch with correspondents in the American towns that many of his emigrants settled in (Irish-born local priests and bishops being his most popular connection) as well as townspeople in Western Ireland. With the contents of these communications, he went on to publish two pamphlets following up on the results of his scheme.

While Tuke's collective writings are a treasure trove of information on his assisted emigration scheme from the Irish side, they are potentially riddled with distortion. In the pursuit of government funding that would go well beyond matching the private donations he had collected, Tuke had plenty of reason to exaggerate the benefits and early successes of his efforts. Therefore, despite Tuke's own reports on the housing and occupational statuses of these emigrants by 1889, it is necessary to cultivate data on these same people through the state and government records of the United States. Such is,

⁵ Margaret Lynch, "Leaving Mayo in 1883-1884," In *The Tuke Emigrants*: (Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT, 2019).

⁶ "James Hack Tuke and His Schemes for Assisted Emigration from the West of Ireland," *History Ireland*: (May 7, 2013).

and has been, the intent of Dr. Lynch. While hundreds of pages of research notes have been compiled by Dr. Lynch and her interns over the course of five years (I myself participated in this firsthand research in 2017), the raw data had not been entered into any form of useable database and it therefore was not synthesizable on a largescale. Thus, in order to analyze trends in this population a database first needed to be generated where the data points could be compiled, synthesized, and interpreted. However, Dr. Lynch's research is ongoing and out of fifteen sailings and a total of 9,482 immigrants, she has gathered information on only four sailings.

Of the four sailings, (each consisting of at least 200 passengers) it should be considered that each passenger has up to 148 data variables associated with them. Working alone it would have been virtually impossible for me to enter and analyze the entirety of data regarding all passengers. Though perhaps not the best representational method, I opted to focus on a single sailing, that of the S.S. Canadian in April of 1884. This decision was made for a variety of reasons. Dr. Lynch's research notes on this sailing were the most well organized and complete as it was the first manifest she started research on in 2015 and the sailing's passengers were destined for locations that aligned with the general trends she had sensed throughout her work regarding the Tuke Scheme. Further, though a random sampling of passengers from each completed manifest would have been more representational, for the purpose of a cohesive, story-arched virtual exhibit selecting only a single sailing seemed appropriate. Then, with this S.S. Canadian passenger database, comparisons between Tuke's reports and immigrant realities could be made to reveal a more accurate vision of the impact of the Tuke Emigration Scheme on Western Ireland, the passengers themselves, and the American communities they

settled in. Lastly, it was my intent to display this vision to the audience traditionally most interested in the Tuke Emigration Scheme—hobby historians and family genealogists—through an accessible, immersive, virtual exhibit.

Seeing as my thesis has taken the form of a digital project rather than a traditional research paper, I have documented the process from its earliest stages to completion in order to demonstrate both the soft and hard public history skills that I have sharpened along the way. Looking back on months of work—countless hours spent entering data, taking notes on how to use relevant programs, scouring the websites of local historical societies and forums for leads, and getting in contact with faculty and staff from a variety of university departments—it can be disheartening for me to view my website and know that the grunt work of public historians so often goes unrecognized. However, along the way I began to recognize that though this process has been extremely challenging, it has been equally as rewarding and I would like to share it.

II. The Process

Naturally, this process started with the creation of a passenger database. It is noteworthy that while I needed this database for my own research purposes, initially it was Margaret Lynch who requested that I design and populate a database for the mass of data she had collected through the Irish American Archive Society. This data included information gathered from 1900- 1950, including from the United States Census, marriage and death certificates, state-issued censuses, Irish baptismal records, Irish departure ship manifests, United States arrival ship manifests, and additional Irish civil

records.⁷ And, while Dr. Lynch does publish her own work, as the director of this local history group she is also dedicated to serving the research needs of other historians and genealogists and therefore wanted this database to serve not just our own research questions, but also those of other users. As will be demonstrated, this stipulation added a level of complexity to the project.

The first step in designing and creating a database was to determine which software would be both compatible with qualitative, long-term population data and relatively easy to learn since I have had no formal training in database creation. After speaking with Dr. Reich about his own experience with qualitative databases, I decided to use SPSS as my software of choice. SPSS is useful in instances where one needs to run a query with multiple variables which is particularly useful for this type of data analysis; for example, one could determine “Of the passengers who claimed they were destined for Cleveland, Ohio, how many were located there in the 1900 census?” Additionally, SPSS allows for defining measurement levels and variable types as well as the coding of variables. Measurement levels and variable types allow one to define how the data should be read by the system when running queries; is the data quantitative or qualitative, hierarchal or without ranking, numerical or text, and so on. Coding variables not only makes data entry a much quicker process, but most importantly it ensures consistency. Rather than worrying about typos or minor discrepancies in capitalization that would prevent similar data from being grouped, coding information such as locations, occupations, gender, and the like protects against those errors.

⁷ Margaret Lynch, Mary Rose Flynn, Erin Kelly, Sean McCarthy, Shane Meehan, and Jacquelyn Wilson, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*, (November, 2020), distributed by Irish American Archive Society.

However, as much as coding promotes consistency, it does raise questions of best practice. In preparation for designing the passenger database, I read *Historical Research Handbook: Designing Databases for Historical Research* by Mark Merry of the University of London.⁸ Here, it became apparent to me that there is more to entering data and defining the purpose of a database than I had previously anticipated. Namely, I needed to meet with Dr. Lynch to determine whether the express purpose of the database was to be record-linkage or pattern elucidation and aggregate analysis. The former would mean refraining from coding, as it emphasizes maintaining the integrity of the source material by transcribing verbatim, even in the case of obvious recording error or misspelling. Marginal notes and other abnormal markings would also need to be taken into account. The latter entails standardization of the records to allow for effective aggregation of the data and trend-finding. While this seemed like the more useful option for both my own purposes and those of Dr. Lynch and future researchers, there were some instances where the standardization option was hard to discern, or, it would potentially be useful to have the verbatim data transcription.

Particularly relevant to record collection of immigrant populations is the tendency of names to be changed upon arrival to the United States. Amongst Irish immigrants, this is a trend that often impacted both first and last names. For example, the Irish first names of Ellen and Sabina were often changed to Nellie and Cecilia respectively. Or surnames beginning with “Mc” had the prefix dropped. But, there are also instances of “Bourke” having the “o” dropped to become “Burke” by the 1900 census, or “McGuinty” becoming

⁸ Mark Merry, *Designing Databases for Historical Research* (London: University of London Press, 2020).

“McGinty,” “Henne” to “Hanney.” Were these intentional, legal changes or simply mistakes made by fallible census surveyors? Is it important to document spelling changes that will impede data aggregation if there is question of their legitimacy? Ultimately, Dr. Lynch and I agreed to document only the spelling variances that seemed probable rather than mistaken as determined by her experience in the field of Irish American genealogy. Then, I created variables to track if an individual had undergone legitimate name alterations between their departure in 1884 and their first United States census record in 1900 (due to the destruction of the 1890 census records), along with variables listing those new names. Any instances of names being presumably misspelled were standardized to the most common spelling of the name. Unfortunately, the nature of the database does not allow us to track which individuals had their names standardized and this could pose a problem in the case that Dr. Lynch and I were wrong in assuming it was an error rather than intentional. Such is the risk we decided to take in order to preserve the analytical power of the database.

Similarly, the question of standardization versus maintaining the integrity of the sources was a major obstacle in the entry of occupations. The majority of Irish immigrants were employed in unskilled labor positions in a variety of fields. The most popular occupation was “day laborer,” however some census surveyors recorded this only as “laborer.” Presumably, those are the same, but if entered verbatim in the database they would be read as distinct. Fortunately, the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics maintains the Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) System which serves to remedy this issue.⁹ The system is traditionally used by federal agencies to classify

⁹ “Standard Occupational Classification System,” US Bureau of Labor Statistics: (2010).

workers into occupational categories for the very purpose of data collection, aggregation, and dissemination. Therefore, I suggested to Dr. Lynch that this classification system be used to standardize and code the occupations of the individuals in order to strengthen the analytical power of the database. While she agreed that using this system to code the occupations was going to be necessary to make any meaningful data calculations, she was hesitant to forego the verbatim details of the census entries entirely, and rightfully so.

While the SOC system does incorporate 867 labor positions into its code, it is impossible to account for the level of position detail that an exact transcription could. For example, while there is a SOC code for “Miner/Driller,” the system cannot portray that an individual was a *coal* miner, or even more specifically, a coal mining *weighman*.

Additionally, the SOC system may differentiate a “Clerical” position from an “Assembler” position, but fails to note that both of these individuals worked in a paper mill, a notable similarity for two immigrants living in the paper mill-rich city of Holyoke, Massachusetts. To combat this dilemma which would hide as many trends in immigrant occupations as it would reveal, I decided to make two distinct variables regarding passenger occupation in 1900. One variable contains the SOC-coded occupation to allow for relative ease in data analysis and protects against typos or similar discrepancies that would alter data counts, and the second variable contains the exact census occupation—though again, with spelling standardized to protect against surveyor errors and variances—in order to give greater detail when needed.

While the previous instances were examples which benefitted the aims of Dr. Lynch and me, other adaptations were made to the database to accommodate the potential research questions of future historians. The most obvious and complex case regards the

number of children. While the 1900 census reports on “total children born” and “total children living,” I recognized that the information as given is probably not in its most useful form. Most likely, one would be interested in the child mortality rate amongst this group of immigrants since it is a commonly used indicator of a community’s well-being. Assuming as much, I made a variable documenting the child mortality rates of each family group. However, it occurred to me that researchers also may be interested in the average number of children per family, so a variable was also created for that entry. This led me to consider the possibility that one would strictly be interested in ‘total children living’ and conversely, ‘total children deceased.’ While the existence of one of those variables would presume the value of the other, I was determined to make information as readily available to researchers as possible and therefore created variables for each. Lastly, it may be of interest for researchers to know how many children in a particular family group were born prior to immigration versus how many children were born after arrival in the United States, a question that would otherwise require cross-referencing multiple records if not included as database variables. So from the prompting of the 1900 census records noting two data points relating to children, six database variables were born.

For my own research questions, only passenger data through the 1900 United States census was relevant. While Dr. Lynch had gathered records through the 1950 census for some passengers in order to track their status over the entirety of their lives, my project regarding the success of Tuke’s Scheme for the West of Ireland and the immigrants themselves could focus in on the two snapshots in time of 1884 and 1900. Once the 77 variables containing passenger data up through the 1900 census were defined

and all relevant information entered, I was ready to begin the analytical portion of my project. Ironically, the very nature of the SPSS database that makes it so useful for qualitative, long-term population data also makes it rather complicated to function. Seeing as I did not enter a History Master's program due to my love of statistical analysis, I was in need of some assistance to run the queries necessary to answer my research questions. After contacting the university's Data Management librarian, Yasmeen Shorish, she advised me to apply for help through the JMU Statistical Consulting Center. I was paired with the director of the center, Dr. Hassan Hamdan. Over the course of two meetings with Dr. Hamdan he reviewed my database's formatting to ensure everything was appropriately structured and entered in order to run the queries and recommended I compose a detailed series of questions I would like to ask of the dataset, then he not only helped me answer those questions through queries, but provided me with the guidance I would need to run any further queries I desired on my own. Together we ran a series of 43 queries in total. For the purposes of my project, the majority of these were rather straightforward frequency charts and histograms and a few multi-variable analyses, but he explained the database I had created was capable of much more complex statistical questions if ever required.

After a semester's worth of database creation, data entry, and statistical analysis, the next stage was website building! Unfortunately, this step was just as daunting for me as I had not had any previous experience designing a website and certainly not one with complex custom maps, image slideshows, and data displays. I spoke with the library's Director of Digital Projects, Kevin Hegg, for advice on the best and most user-friendly website building platforms, the programs and displays that could be hosted by each, and

generally what would be possible for me to effectively utilize in creating a virtual exhibit on the passengers of the S.S. Canadian and the Tuke Emigration Scheme at large.

In terms of website building platforms, Kevin suggested limiting myself to options provided through the university's library in order to ensure that the project could live on and be used in my professional portfolio. This left me with WordPress, ArcGIS StoryMaps, or Story Map Cascade. While all of these options brought different possibilities for my virtual exhibit, they also all had significant limitations and I was left to decide which provided the largest net gain for my project. While WordPress is very customizable in terms of themes, fonts, and layouts and operates as a traditional website, not all map and image displays are compatible with it. Specifically, the majority of map and image displays Kevin most highly recommended I use would not be compatible with WordPress. Because maps and images were so critical to the type of virtual exhibit I had in mind, I determined that despite its user-friendly set up and popularity, I would not create a site through WordPress.

ArcGIS StoryMaps is a relatively recent site format developed especially for "stories" that would be best told through an immersive mapped experience. The platform is only compatible with ArcGIS maps and is geared towards projects looking to utilize map displays more than text. While the platform is impressive, Kevin suggested that due to my lack of experience, I stay away from ArcGIS mapping if possible. Additionally, while I was planning on having maps playing a powerful role in my virtual exhibit, I acknowledged that other displays such as data charts and images would be just as important and wanted to ensure I picked a platform that could successfully host those.

That left Story Map Cascade which is coincidentally also a branch of ArcGIS. However, unlike StoryMaps, Cascade is an even newer platform that is first and foremost designed to host ArcGIS maps, but accommodates other digital map displays as well. Additionally, the site “cascades” through either narrative or immersive slides meaning it can host both large bodies of text and maps, data displays, photo slideshows, and more that can be explored by viewers. This scrollable, dual-designed platform seemed like a great fit for the type of exhibit I had in mind. However, due to its newness, the platform has a lot of bugs, is not very customizable, and there are not many tutorials available. While it *can* host any graphic or map with an embedding code, the size and formatting of these graphics often becomes distorted. Despite its risks and shortfalls, I decided Story Map Cascade was the best option for my project in terms of usability, hosting capabilities, accessibility, and formatting.

After establishing Cascade as my site platform, Kevin suggested several programs and tools I could use to display my data, maps, and other information. While SPSS is able to generate data charts and graphs, the designs of these infographics are quite basic and not customizable. Recognizing that part of designing an exhibit for the public is aesthetics and visual appeal, Kevin suggested I use Tableau to create embeddable data displays. Tableau Student is available through the library’s resources and LinkedIn Learning, and the software itself provide tutorials on how to use its advanced functions. In theory, Tableau is compatible with datasets imported from the vast majority of spreadsheet programs including SPSS. However, where Tableau struggles is reading coded data. While SPSS allows for users to swap out numerical code for their text labels, Tableau will only receive the data in its coded form. And, as a “smart” technology, the

generated data display is assumed to be what the user wanted and therefore cannot be manually altered with text labels. With no comparable programs offered through the university, this obstacle was the most difficult to overcome. The aggregation, synthesis, and analysis of the S.S. Canadian passenger data as a microcosm of the larger Tuke Emigration Scheme was at the heart of not only my database, but the entirety of my project. Without the charts and graphs to display those trends concretely to viewers, the exhibit falls flat.

While I was unfortunately not able to get Tableau to display my data successfully, I was able to use a free, non-coded, embeddable online data display tool called ChartBlocks. The free version does not allow for SPSS spreadsheet imports, but I was able to export the necessary data to Excel and adapt it to the site. This program allows for simple chart creation and customization and the data displays can even be interacted with by viewers, very similar to Tableau. While the available options are not as robust as Tableau and data must be displayed as a graph rather than a frequency table which would have been preferable in some instances, this free and easy tool was able to do the job in a pinch! I ended up dialing back the number of data displays I had originally planned for because of the time constraints that my ongoing issues with Tableau left me under and the adaptations that had to be made to my database to get it to work with ChartBlocks, but those that made it in do give my website a more professional look and feel and hopefully work to demonstrate my data synthesis firsthand.

Outside of data synthesis, the other key piece of a project regarding immigrants of course includes maps. Considering the data available to me, I envisioned the exhibit hosting two main types of maps—journey maps and population maps. Journey maps

function as flow charts and work in tandem with a chronology to tell a story through a map from beginning to end. Aptly, the free online tool that Kevin suggested I use for this style of map is called StoryMap JS by Knight Lab of Northwestern University. StoryMap JS's creation format is laid out similarly to a slideshow and is easy to use and customize. Not only does it allow for a map of the step-by-step path taken, but also for each of those locations to be accompanied by an image and textual description. It then generates an embedding code that is compatible with Cascade. I chose to frame the passengers' journey from the west of Ireland to Boston, Massachusetts over the course of eleven days as a story full of all their stops and struggles along the way. Pieced together through arrival and departure manifests, the sailing log of the S.S. Canadian, and Tuke's papers, the eleven-day trek fit quite nicely into the format.

However, outside of the S.S. Canadian's sailing path, the majority of location data I had entered into the database was best served by population maps. A major aspect of investigating the success of Tuke's Emigration Scheme and the vision Tuke had for it versus its ultimate reality was to track the locations emigrants stated they were headed to upon registering for the scheme in 1884 compared to where they were living in 1900. Therefore, the data would be appropriately displayed through differing sets of geographic markers: one marker type depicting where emigrants claimed they were headed and another depicting where they ended up. Unfortunately, the only mapping platform Kevin had mentioned to me that could create such maps was ArcGIS. While ArcGIS is a powerful and versatile mapping platform, Kevin recognized that I should avoid it due to my lack of experience. This left me with no university-offered, user-friendly mapping platform and meant that I would have to either give up on my plans to feature population

maps on my website or search for an outside platform that I could manage to access and operate on my own. Seeing that these maps were at the heart of my project, I decided to see what other options were out there. I came across two such options, both powered by Google; Google My Maps and Google Earth Historical Overlay.

Google My Maps is a free, data-driven mapping tool that works with locational data in the form of Google Spreadsheets. I was able to import relevant portions of my data to Google Spreadsheets and add columns of geographic coordinates to create a total of three multilayered maps displaying the Irish hometowns represented by all S.S. Canadian passengers, where they all claimed they were headed and where they ended up, and the particular variability of western-bound passenger locations. Despite the ease of this platform, it does have its drawbacks and limitations. Because Cascade is designed to work best with ArcGIS maps, it does not display all features of Google My Maps. For instance, the key defining what each color marker represents is not displayed. Due to the lack of a key, I had to settle for noting the marker colors in the text portion of the webpage. Additionally, Google My Maps does not have a feature to link two similar data points between data sets meaning there is no visible connection between the marker of where a particular passenger such as, say, Martin Gavin claimed to be going in 1884 and where he was located in 1900, which would have been particularly useful in this setting. It would have also been immensely useful to be able to cluster markers to demonstrate that a single location may have hosted many individuals, but unfortunately if markers overlap there is no way to show it was a popular spot. Despite these shortcomings, given the circumstances Google My Maps was the best mapping tool I had at my disposal.

One of the map types I was most excited to undertake for this project was finding 1900 maps of relevant areas and overlaying passenger data onto them. Again, ArcGIS does have these capabilities but triangulating the historical maps onto a modern satellite map and then importing my data to the platform proved to be too difficult a task. Instead, I was able to manually recreate a similar process using Google Earth Historical Overlay. For Cleveland, Ohio and Holyoke, Massachusetts I found 1900 city ward maps and laid them atop modern satellite maps by matching up key geographic features such as canals and rivers. In addition to the city's wards, these maps include the majority of street names which allowed me to locate the addresses of the immigrants as given on the 1900 census as well as those of key locations such as Catholic schools and churches and popular immigrant job sites.

In the case of Cleveland, scholarship published by the Irish American Archives Society reported on the boundaries of the historic 'Irish Triangle' neighborhood which formed in 1848.¹⁰ By outlining what was colloquially known as 'The Angle' and then mapping out the street addresses of Tuke immigrants and the industries they worked in, it became apparent that by 1900 this neighborhood still remained the epicenter of Irish immigration to the city. Conversely, Holyoke's ward map told a different story. While the majority of Great Famine immigrants settled in an impoverished canal-side neighborhood near Prospect Park in the city's fourth ward called 'The Patch,' the Tuke immigrant experience differed.¹¹ All immigrants aided by the scheme lived in the city's first ward, known as 'The Flats,' by 1900, notable due to its otherwise lack of Irish immigrants and

¹⁰ Margaret Lynch, "The Irish and The Angle," Irish American Archive Society, n.d.

¹¹ Springfield, MA – Our Plural History, "Irish Immigrants in Holyoke," Springfield Technical Community College: (2009).

its booming population of French-Canadians.¹² This mapping method was also used to create a map demonstrating the connection between Pennsylvania's known anthracite coal deposits in 1890 and the cities that Tuke immigrants claim they were heading to. The University of Pennsylvania digitized an 1890 map that lightly shaded the coal deposits; this map was able to be laid over a modern satellite map by aligning state borders and bodies of water.¹³ As demonstrated by the 80 Pennsylvania-bound passengers, all but fifteen were destined for cities along the coal deposits.

While these Google Earth Historical Overlay maps were easy to create, customize, and use for further historical analysis, they do have some shortcomings. Notably, they do not allow for custom map keys which is a minor setback. Rather than being shown on the map, the meaning of the color distinctions of outlined boundaries had to be noted in the text. Additionally, while I was able to adjust marker styles and sizing, there was no way for me to automatically populate the maps with my data. Instead, I selected marker styles that aligned with the number of immigrants present on each street or within each city, though unfortunately the given options stopped at "10" which left me to signify locations with more than ten individuals with a star. I manually adjusted the magnification of the markers depending on their population so that their scale would correspond with the size of their populations. Lastly, I manually placed the markers on the map which allows for relative accuracy, but not perfection. Unfortunately, Cascade is not able to host Google Earth as an embedded graphic to be explored, so the historical

¹² Michael Burke, "Immigrant Sweat Built Paper City," American Centuries, Massachusetts Department of Higher Education.

¹³ Geological Survey of Pennsylvania, "New General Map of the Anthracite Region.: Revised to Date," Harrisburg, PA, 1890.

overlay maps are featured as backdrop images making them static rather than immersive experiences.

In addition to maps, another key infographic featured in the virtual exhibit is Timeline JS. Like StoryMap JS, this online tool is offered through Knight Lab of Northwestern University and was suggested by Kevin Hegg. The timeline is created via a Google spreadsheet template provided by the service. Cells are then filled with corresponding text or links such as slide titles, dates, background and inlaid images, photo credit, and body text. When completed, the link to the Google spreadsheet is entered into the timeline generator and a unique embedding code is provided. It is relatively easy to use and is hosted by Cascade. Because of its user-friendly format and clean, professional look, I decided to incorporate Timeline JS into the virtual exhibit. I determined that timelines would be particularly useful in establishing the local histories of the Irish immigrant populations in the two specific cities featured in the project, Cleveland and Holyoke, leading up to the arrival of Tuke immigrants. The timelines serve as an engaging means to situate the audience into the environment that the immigrants would have heard about from friends and relatives prior to their departure and what they would have experienced as they arrived.

From the beginning steps of designing and populating a passenger database to adding the finishing touches to a Cascade virtual exhibit, the process of completing this thesis project has been the most challenging, and rewarding, undertaking of my academic career. In proposing this project, I never anticipated the questions of integrity that would come into play when creating a historical database, or how the answers to those questions would affect its synthesizing capabilities. I gained versatility as a public historian by

exposing myself to digital programs like SPSS, ArcGIS Cascade, Tableau, StoryMap and Timeline JS, Google My Maps, and Google Earth. Simultaneously, I was able to expand my archival research skills by using resources like ward maps, coal deposit maps, the original papers of the James H. Tuke and the Tuke Committee, and the United States census and other genealogical records. While I had to give up on a lot of my grand plans for the project, I have come to realize that the greatest value of my project (at least to me!) can be found in the stumbling blocks I encountered long the way because they are where I learned the most.

III. The Research

While it goes without saying that the Great Famine of 1845-1852 drastically altered the course of both the histories of Ireland and the United States, the issues it wrought upon Ireland's system of land ownership set the scene for subsequent lesser famines. Of particular interest is the famine of 1879-1881. This famine officially took hold in the western counties of Mayo, Donegal, and Galway after a failed potato crop, but it was exacerbated by political unrest in the region rooted in the Land War.¹⁴ Essentially, due to the failure of the government of the United Kingdom to properly reform land tenancy in the West following the turmoil of the Great Famine, these counties remained overpopulated and underprovided for decades after the initial potato blight. It was only a matter of time before the overcrowded and overworked fields of western Ireland once again gave out. Though little researched, this lesser western famine gave rise to an emigration scheme from Ireland to the United States and Canada that attempted to shift

¹⁴ For more information on Ireland's Land Wars read *Land Questions in Modern Ireland* by Tony Varley and Fergus J.M. Campbell.

the narrative of Irish immigrants in North America. With its strict qualifications and regulations, the Tuke Emigration Scheme sought to select only those Irish families best equipped for success in their new lives and then to send them to cities unsaturated by Great Famine immigrants in the hopes that they would avoid anti-Irish sentiments and be greeted with plenty of job opportunities. The question arises, did the scheme shift the narrative of Irish Americans, and if so, to what extent?

James Hack Tuke was an English Quaker who got his philanthropic start during the Great Famine when he was sent by the Society of Friends to review the suffering of the Irish and report back. Ultimately, so distraught by the destitution and misery he witnessed, Tuke set up his first privately funded emigration scheme aiding young girls to become domestic servants in the United States.¹⁵ Unfortunately, upon returning to Ireland in 1880 he realized that the status of farmers along the western coast had not changed. The trip inspired him to publish the pamphlet *Irish Distress and its Remedies* where he reasoned that families need a minimum of 10-20 acres of farmland to survive—an impossible feat in the crowded, rocky region. Inspired by his prior success, Tuke once again suggested assisted emigration. Tuke himself traveled to North America in the summer of 1880 to investigate what areas would be most suitable for agricultural Irish families. He focused on locations rife with employment opportunities, upcoming economic development, and the promise of integration and assimilation.¹⁶ Ultimately, he decided it was the “western” (actually the Midwestern) states of America and Canada’s province of Manitoba that best suited said aims. With this, he set about designing a

¹⁵ Gerard Moran, *Fleeing from Famine in Connemara: James Hack Tuke and Assisted Emigration Schemes in the 1880s*, Maynooth Studies in Local History, Number 135: (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2018).

¹⁶ Gerard Moran, “James Hack Tuke and His Schemes for Assisted Emigration from the West of Ireland,” *History Ireland*, (May 7, 2013).

privately funded emigration scheme to assist as many families out of Ireland as possible, but quickly determined he would also need to apply for government funding to make a sizable impact on the population. In 1882, after Tuke was able to demonstrate the early success and merit of his idea, the government of the United Kingdom created the Tuke Committee and nationalized the scheme.¹⁷

After a 21-page report entitled, “Ought Emigration from Ireland to be Assisted?” which first and foremost placed the blame for the famine of 1879-1881 squarely on the shoulders of the UK Government, officials were in no place to deny Tuke funding. In addition to noting the failure of the Land Act in redressing the land distribution issues of the West, Tuke notes that in order to make the region viable, extensive bog drainage, railway construction, tree planting, and other exhaustive infrastructural efforts would need to be undertaken—a massive task that the colonizing government would not be willing to take up. Therefore, Tuke argues that the best way for them to quickly and relatively cheaply wash their hands of this government-induced famine was to fund his scheme.¹⁸ The government caved, but barely. The budget would be tight.

Begrudgingly funded by a government that was not too keen on the idea of assisting Irish Catholics, Tuke had to streamline his scheme to create the most effective impact at an equally efficient cost. To do this, he and his committee created a set of qualifications to be met in order for passengers to apply for assisted emigration:

1— Persons Suitable. — Families of those engaged in Agriculture, whether holders of land or labourers.

¹⁷ James Hack Tuke, “Ought Emigration from Ireland to Be Assisted?” In *Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of “Mr. Tuke’s Fund,” for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889*, Contemporary Review: (1882), 61.

¹⁸ Tuke, “Ought Emigration from Ireland to Be Assisted?,” 696.

2–The workers in each family should be in proportion of one to three. Wife will not count as a worker; strong boys or girls of 12 and upwards may be counted as workers.

3–One person, at least, in each family must be able to speak English.

4–The Names of Townspeople, Tradespeople, or Single Persons are not to be received

5–Any Person making false statements as to their families or substituting an outsider for a member of his family will be disqualified.

6–The following points must be made clear to applicants:

- (1) – That the taking down of the Names by the Relieving Officer does not imply that they are selected... (2) – That applicants will be informed whether they are selected or not... (3) – Until they are so informed, they must, on no consideration, give up holdings or make any preparations whatever for leaving.

...That as the Committee are responsible for selection, they are also to a certain extent responsible for the destinations; and as they do not receive good accounts of cities in the Eastern States of America, emigrants can be sent thither only on receipt of very encouraging letters from their relations already settled there, perhaps not even then. Canada and the Western States, whence the Committee have received offers of work, are preferable for emigrants.¹⁹

From this list it is obvious that Tuke and his committee were dedicated to not only the success of those they assisted in emigrating, but also the success of the towns they were leaving. By assisting families with a high work output and English literacy, then encouraging them to settle in western states where they would be welcomed and more likely to find employment, Tuke proved that he cared about the fate of those he was assisting when they got to their new homes. Conversely, the qualifications show

¹⁹ Sydney C. Buxton and Howard Hodgkin, “Mr. Tuke’s Fund’: Instructions to Relieving Officers in Taking Down Names of Applicants for Emigration.” In *Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of “Mr. Tuke’s Fund,” for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889., (1883), 61.*

consideration for the futures of the Irish towns the scheme would pull from. By selecting only whole family groups of farmers, Tuke ensured that plots of land would be entirely freed up and redistributed to those who remained. He excluded townspeople whose absence would not fix the land problem and worked to leave tradespeople who played important roles in providing service to these rural towns. Unfortunately, the last sub-point of number six reveals a dilemma that Tuke often came across. Seeking to secure assistance, many Irish farming families would sell their land before they were officially selected to emigrate in order to force Tuke's hand.²⁰

Meeting annually to discuss the logistics and impacts of the scheme, the Tuke Committee convened three times in total. Its last meeting took place in July of 1884, over a month after the departure of the last of the fifteen sailings.²¹ The subsequent report generated by the meeting stated the conditions that called for the close of the scheme, the total cost of the scheme, and the number of people assisted. Ultimately, by 1884 the Tuke Committee had spent all of its budget. While they could have petitioned for more, they believed they had, "largely helped, by the means of emigration, to meet the emergency which was existing in 1882-3 in certain poverty-stricken districts in the West of Ireland, [and] have decided for the present to cease their operations."²² Further, the Committee mentions a, "lessened demand for labour in America, caused by the prolonged financial

²⁰ Gerard Moran, "James Hack Tuke and His Schemes for Assisted Emigration from the West of Ireland," *History Ireland*: (May 7, 2013).

²¹ Tuke Committee, "Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of 'Mr. Tuke's Fund,'" In *Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889*, National Press Agency, Limited: (1884), 135.

²² Tuke Committee, "Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of 'Mr. Tuke's Fund,'" 135.

crisis,” which made continued assisted emigration inadvisable.²³ Indeed, the Panic of 1884 started at the very beginning of July, closing down 5% of all American mines and factories—the job sectors most popular amongst Tuke immigrants—and is doubtlessly the crisis being referred to.²⁴ Over the course of its three-year span, the Tuke Emigration Scheme aided in the emigration of 9,482 individuals (17% of the population) at an average cost of just over £7 per person, which equates to \$1,400 in 2021 for a grand total of over \$13 million.²⁵

Keeping in mind the qualifications of the scheme and the lengths that families were willing to go to in an attempt to be selected for it, the question arises as to how strictly these measures were actually followed. A case study on the passengers of the S.S. Canadian sailing of March 13, 1884 sheds light on the topic. Unfortunately, due to the destruction of the 1890 United States census records in a fire, the earliest retrievable census records regarding Tuke immigrants are the 1900 census records, at least 16 years after their arrival. For one, the gap in records makes it difficult to track many of the passengers. In total, only 197 of the original 279 S.S. Canadian passengers were found in any record whatsoever (including earlier state censuses, marriage, and death records) and only 151 were definitively found in the 1900 census.²⁶ Additionally, it makes it virtually impossible to know the whereabouts of the majority of most Tuke immigrants for those 16 years. However, despite the limitations to the research, conclusions regarding the

²³ Tuke Committee, “Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of ‘Mr. Tuke’s Fund,’” 135.

²⁴ “A Remedy for Contagion From the Panic of 1884? Researchers Examine the Effect of Banking Unrest and Subsequent Bailouts During the Panic of 1884.” *The Wall Street Journal*, 2016.

²⁵ Tuke Committee, “Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of ‘Mr. Tuke’s Fund,’” 136 and Ian Webster “Inflation Rate in 1888 UK Inflation Calculator,” CPI Inflation Calculator, Official Data Foundation.

²⁶ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

reality of the Tuke Emigration Scheme in the United States, as assessed by S.S. Canadian passenger data, can be drawn. As will be demonstrated, this passenger data, coupled with Tuke's publications, local historical records of the towns they settled in, and additional supplementary sources reveal rather varied experiences for Tuke families in the United States. Depending on their location (Cleveland, Ohio; the Pennsylvania coal mining region; western states; or Holyoke, Massachusetts), immigrants faced different challenges and fell into differing job sectors, but to some degree all seem to have achieved some semblance of "success" by 1900. Success here is defined by their employment, home address, home ownership status, literacy, and ability to assimilate or create welcoming communities for themselves. In tandem with the obvious improvement to western Ireland, the Tuke Emigration Scheme can be recognized as a genuine and successful means of bettering the Irish-American immigration narrative *and* aiding famine conditions back in Ireland.

Presumably in order to improve their chances of selection, families reported what American city they were destined for and, per the scheme's qualifications, evidence of a relative's success if they were seeking to settle in the Eastern states. Given these stated destinations and the locations reported on various records tied to the immigrants following their arrival, it appears that 62% of Tuke immigrants were in the same city as they initially reported they would settle in by 1900. Notably, that figure increases to 78% if considering the county.²⁷ For the majority of immigrants, those who actually settled where they originally stated, one may ask why the immigrants were initially drawn to those areas in the first place and what factors lent to their successes there. Namely, the

²⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

two most popular destinations with the least settlement discrepancy were Cleveland, Ohio and various anthracite coal mining towns in Pennsylvania.²⁸ Conversely, for the minority of immigrants (22%) who did not even settle in the same county as they initially stated, what drove them to stray? Were they faced with economic or social hardship? In an effort to be selected for the scheme did they intentionally lie and name a western destination when they were actually eastern-bound? The two destinations with the most settlement discrepancy were Western states (defined as west of Indiana) and Holyoke, Massachusetts.²⁹ An analysis of 1900 census data put in conversation with the local histories of these four regions sheds light on the reality of the Tuke Emigration Scheme in the United States.

By far, the most popular destination of Tuke immigrants was Cleveland, Ohio. Of the 279 S.S. Canadian passengers, 30% of them initially listed Cleveland as their destination. Of the 151 found in the 1900 census, 40% resided in Cleveland.³⁰ Its allure was not happenstance. Cleveland was home to a number of Irish immigrants prior to the Great Famine, but the tragedy caused immigration to the city to skyrocket. By 1848 there were 1,024 Irish immigrants living in Cleveland.³¹ This major wave of immigrants largely emigrated from Achill Island, a rural island of Ireland's county Mayo. During the famine years, it was typical for the Irish to emigrate in community groups, creating immigration chains between particular Irish and American settlements. The Achill

²⁸ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

²⁹ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

³⁰ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*, it is also important to note that due to the Irish American Archive Society's geographic location in Cleveland, Ohio there is some underlying bias relating to its status as the location where the most S.S. Canadian passengers were found in 1900 records. The researchers had better access to these local records and more knowledge of Irish immigrant trends in the area that greatly benefitted their search.

³¹ Ian Webster, "Inflation Rate in 1888 UK Inflation Calculator," CPI Inflation Calculator, Official Data Foundation.

Islanders found their way to what became known as “The Triangle” or more commonly, “The Angle.” This triangular neighborhood was home almost exclusively to the city’s Irish community and straddled the mouth of the Cuyahoga River, encapsulating all three hearts of Cleveland’s industry: the dockyards, steel mills, and railroad depots.³² While quite the jump from their agricultural upbringings, these early immigrants were quickly able to find employment as industrial laborers.³³

But Cleveland’s deep-rooted connection to Achill Island was just getting underway. Shortly after the end of the Great Famine immigration wave, the city was unique in its second wave of Irish immigration in 1860. Hit by a lesser famine, thousands more fled Achill Island and followed the previously established immigration chain to Cleveland’s Angle.³⁴ Several Catholic parishes and schools opened in the area to serve the rapidly growing Irish Catholic community, including the influential St. Malachi’s. Founded in 1865, the parish was located in the heart of the Angle and quickly became a refuge to the neighborhood’s newest and poorest members.³⁵ And of course, the story was no different from 1882-1884 when at least 1,000 Tuke immigrants flocked to the city over the course of the scheme.³⁶ During the scheme’s selection process, immigrants were asked to supply the name of their parish. Being a small island, everyone from Achill was a member of its only parish, aptly named Achill parish. Of the parish’s 84 members

³² Lynch, “The Irish and The Angle,” Irish American Archive Society, n.d.

³³ Encyclopedia of Cleveland History, Case Western Reserve University, “Irish”: (May 11, 2018).

³⁴ Lynch, “The Irish and The Angle,” Irish American Archive Society, n.d.

³⁵ “Our History, Catholic Diocese of Cleveland, Cleveland, OH.” Accessed March 11, 2021.
<http://www.dioceseofcleveland.org/about/our-history>.

³⁶ This is a rough estimate derived from the five sailings researched by the IAAS; data analysis incomplete (but at least 10% to Cleveland, Ohio per these results).

onboard the S.S. Canadian, 84.5% of them stated they were settling in Cleveland clearly demonstrating the strong pull between the two locations.³⁷

The large influx of Achill Islanders to Cleveland had a demonstrable impact. Despite Tuke's wishes that all emigrants be provided with enough spending money to help them settle into their new lives, for the vast majority of these families, their first few months in the United States proved difficult.³⁸ As was the case in the Angle. In 1884, a pastor of St. Malachi's reported that of the parish's 580 families, 270 were non-paying. As an explanation he notes, "The no. of poor Emigrants that settled here last year is very great."³⁹ The "poor emigrants" he refers to would have been those from the 1883 sailing of the Tuke Scheme. While it is clear that Tuke immigrants were for a time not able to contribute financially to their Cleveland church communities, by the end of the century their quality of life, and therefore the extent to which they were able to contribute to the larger community, had improved.

While the Angle was originally a low-income neighborhood described as Cleveland's "first ghetto," by 1900 the area had undergone considerable economic uplift. An archeological analysis done by Zoe Sizemore of Cleveland State University reveals that while the Angle continued to be seen as impoverished and less-than by the larger Cleveland community, in reality a number of its residents were quite well off by the turn of the century. One dig of John Quinn's home, occupied from 1870-1912 and located in the Irishtown Bend portion of the Angle, uncovered several luxury objects such as

³⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

³⁸ "Irish Immigrants: Another Lot of Assisted Passengers Arrive," *Boston Daily Advertiser*: (May 11, 1883).

³⁹ Margaret Lynch, "Leaving Mayo in 1883-1884," In *The Tuke Emigrants*, Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT, 2019.

evidence of multiple styles and sets of porcelain dishware, ornate glassware, and even electrical insulators proving the family had electricity well before it was common.⁴⁰

There is no question that the Quinns were well off, and while John Quinn immigrated prior to the Tuke Scheme, there is evidence that this lifestyle was shared by Tuke immigrants as well, a hint to their economic success. The immigrants who settled in Cleveland represented the largest variety of job fields of all Tuke immigrant destinations, representing engineering, sales work, administrative duties, firefighting, security, food service, and skilled labor, in addition to the typical Irish immigrant position of day laborer.⁴¹ In spite of the higher wages these positions allotted them which would have provided Tuke immigrants the opportunity to move, the decision for virtually all of them to remain in or close to the Angle by 1900 led to their wealth being invested back into the community.⁴² This community enrichment led to the Angle's first recreational park in 1905.⁴³ Whether or not the Angle was on its way to community uplift prior to the arrival of Tuke immigrants has yet to be investigated, but it can be inferred that the Tuke Scheme's push for literate families with high work capacities gave these later immigrants a competitive edge in the Angle and led to the betterment of their new community by 1900.

Outside of Cleveland, the second most popular destination of S.S. Canadian passengers was the anthracite coal region of Pennsylvania. Of the ship's passengers, 80, or 22% claimed to be headed to Pennsylvania, and of that group 81% were headed to

⁴⁰ Zoe Sizemore, "Irishtown Bend - Excavating an Irish Immigrant's Life," *Cleveland Historical*: (2019).

⁴¹ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁴² Cleveland Directory Co. "Map of the City of Cleveland for 1899-1900." Cleveland, Ohio, 1899.

⁴³ Zoe Sizemore, "Irishtown Bend - Excavating an Irish Immigrant's Life," *Cleveland Historical*: (2019).

cities in the mining counties of Columbia, Lackawanna, Luzerne, or Schuylkill.⁴⁴ This correlation becomes apparent when the stated destinations are laid over an 1890 map of anthracite coal deposits published by the Geological Survey of Pennsylvania.⁴⁵ The destination markers perfectly trace the sprinklings of coal deposits throughout central Pennsylvania.⁴⁶ With an eye toward their upbringing, it is no surprise that Irish immigrants, particularly those from the rocky western seaboard, were so drawn to locations centered around mining. The region was home to many of Ireland's prosperous lead mines and even if Tuke immigrants had no firsthand experience working in the mines, they would have been well accustomed to mining town culture.⁴⁷ And, similar to Cleveland (although nowhere near as strong a connection), Pennsylvania mining towns had established immigration chains between the Great Famine generation and those looking to immigrate.

Despite the promising employment opportunities that Pennsylvania's mines offered and the established Irish immigrant populations of these towns, without explicit proof of a job and familial relation Tuke and his Committee were wary of allowing participants of the scheme to settle there. Although it is never explicitly stated, a plausible cause of this hesitancy could have been the bad press circulating throughout Pennsylvanian mines regarding the notorious secret society of the Molly Maguires. Starting in 1861 and continuing through 1877, this group of Irishmen terrorized coal mines in Schuylkill county, committing murder, trashing sites, and causing many mines

⁴⁴ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁴⁵ Geological Survey of Pennsylvania, "New General Map of the Anthracite Region.: Revised to Date," Harrisburg, PA: (1890).

⁴⁶ Geological Survey of Pennsylvania, "New General Map of the Anthracite Region.: Revised to Date," Harrisburg, PA: (1890).

⁴⁷ Mary Kelly and Peadar McArdle, "Historic Mine Sites: Inventory and Risk Classification," Ireland: (Office of Environmental Enforcement, 2009).

to close rather than risk their employees' lives while the violence continued.⁴⁸ To make matters worse, the Molly Maguires often referred to themselves as members of the Ancient Order of Hibernians, a peaceful, Irish Catholic fraternity that was, and remains, the most popular organization amongst Irish American men.⁴⁹ Because of the association, Pennsylvanians were quick to see the Molly Maguires as synonymous with all Irish immigrant men, particularly those who worked in the mines. Philadelphia's Quaker newspaper, *The Friend*, reported on the gang in December of 1876 writing, "The official title of the secret society in America, popularly called 'Molly Maguire' is Ancient Order of Hibernians. None are eligible to membership in it, unless they are members among the Roman Catholics and are Irishmen. To it must be attributed numerous murders and other outrages in the coal region," clearly conflating the Molly Maguire gang murders with all members of the Ancient Order of Hibernians.⁵⁰ The Irish newspaper *The Pilot*, out of Boston, Massachusetts even picked up on the conflation noting, "They [the Ancient Order of Hibernians] should see to it that their Order is not misrepresented by a few black sheep."⁵¹

Worse yet, Schuylkill locals took justice into their own hands by creating vigilante groups to combat the gang. However, these vigilantes often did more harm than good and even worked to frame both the Molly Maguires and the Irish community at large for crimes they themselves committed. *The Pilot* mentions, "We cannot say to what

⁴⁸ William Francis Byron, "Anthracite and the Irish: Extricating the Irish Immigrant Mining Community from the Molly Maguire Myth, Schuylkill County, Pennsylvania, 1850-1879," (University of Maryland, 1996), 123.

⁴⁹ William Francis Byron, "Anthracite and the Irish: Extricating the Irish Immigrant Mining Community from the Molly Maguire Myth, Schuylkill County, Pennsylvania, 1850-1879," (University of Maryland, 1996), 127.

⁵⁰ "The 'Molly Maguire' Trials," *The Friend*, December 2, 1876.

⁵¹ "The Molly Maguire," *The Pilot*, January 1, 1876.

extent the charges against the Molly Maguires are true; but... they are innocent of some crimes laid at their door. For instance, the murder of the O'Donnells in the Schuylkill region... turns out to have been by a "Vigilance Committee."⁵² *The Cambria Freeman* of Ebensburg, Pennsylvania similarly reports, "respectable citizens... may, in the savage cruelty of their vengeance, shame barbarians and involve in punishment innocent as well as guilty. Those who cried loudest against Mollie deeds were inclined to imitate them; nay, were capable of perpetrating more cruel, cold-blooded butcheries than Mollie fiends... No device was left untried to fasten the Wiggins massacre on the Irish."⁵³ The violence finally culminated when the Pinkertons were called in to settle the trouble with the Molly Maguires once and for all.

Up against a stacked jury, the trials ended with the conviction and hanging of twenty Irishmen, the majority sentenced with no evidence other than their ethnicity. One defense attorney cried, "When you hear the term Mollie Maguire used, what does it mean? Has there been an Irishman upon the stand for the last six months in this county who has not been called a Mollie Maguire?"⁵⁴ Indeed, many Irish locals came to remember that execution day as a day of great loss for the community rather than justice. Sixty years after the incident, a townswoman recalled, "When the hour of the hangings arrived for the poor Irish lads, the world suddenly became dark and we had to burn our lamps."⁵⁵ Without a doubt, the recent memory of the trials would have cast serious doubt on the viability of Pennsylvania coal mining towns as a Tuke Scheme destination.

⁵² "The Molly Maguire," *The Pilot*, January 1, 1876.

⁵³ "Condition of Society in the Coal Regions," *Cambria Freeman*, July 6, 1877.

⁵⁴ Hagley Digital Archives, "Commonwealth vs. John Kehoe et Al," 205.

⁵⁵ George Korson, *Minstrels of the Mine Patch: Songs and Stories of the Anthracite Industry*, University of Pennsylvania Press: (1938), 255.

Despite the lingering anti-Irish mentalities and Tuke's misgivings about the region, passengers of the S.S. Canadian who remained in Pennsylvanian coal mining towns were readily employed in the mining field. Though as usual, general day laborer was the most popular occupation amongst the immigrants, equally as many men were employed specifically in the mines in a variety of positions.⁵⁶ Many were employed as coal miners while others worked in the quarries as slate pickers and less popularly, they attended the milling machinery.⁵⁷ Further, families who settled in these towns had some of the highest rates of home ownership of eastern-bound immigrants, at around 33%.⁵⁸ Given the particular strife regarding tenancy in western Ireland leading up to the scheme, Tuke immigrants must have celebrated their status as homeowners in the United States. It seems as though the immigrants who claimed they were destined for the Pennsylvania coal mining region were honest in providing the Tuke Committee with evidence that they had employment and relatives awaiting them on the east coast as they were genuinely successful in settling there despite the looming obstacle of anti-Irish attitudes.

While Cleveland, Ohio and Pennsylvania coal towns represented the destinations most popularly stated by immigrants and the locations they were most likely to live in by 1900, the reality of the Tuke Emigration Scheme was not quite so predictable. Notably, the region with the highest rate of discrepancy between stated destination and location in 1900 is the one Tuke strongly pushed for families to settle in, the "West." For Tuke, this essentially included anything west of Indiana, with a particular emphasis on the Midwestern states of Wisconsin and Minnesota.⁵⁹ Representative of a vast expanse of

⁵⁶ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁵⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁵⁸ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁵⁹ James H. Tuke, *James Hack Tuke: A Memoir*, England: (Macmillan, 1899), 170.

land, in total the West accounted for only 22.6% of the destinations of S.S. Canadian passengers and 21% of their locations in 1900.⁶⁰ Though the rates are similar, in reality, by 1900 western-bound immigrants were 10% less likely to live in the same city they claimed they were headed for than their eastern-bound counterparts.⁶¹

While there is no definite explanation for this tendency, several theories could be offered. For one, these states were still considered the frontier. Unless they were set for one of the urban centers, families moving to the West were most likely planning to pursue agricultural opportunities. In the grand scheme, starting a homestead in Iowa is not much different than starting one in Nebraska. Therefore, while a family may have reported to the Tuke Committee that they were heading to a particular western city or state, better land prices somewhere else upon arrival would easily explain a change of plans. Similarly, unlike anyone applying to settle in the East, these families did not need to provide the Tuke Committee with any evidence that they would be meeting or regrouping with relatives who had arrived in an earlier immigration wave. With no previously established ties to the region, western-bound Tuke immigrants had much more freedom to roam upon their arrival than those reuniting large, extended families. Or, it may have been *because* of the lack of proof needed that families seeking to qualify for the scheme provided a western state as their destination. Not only did the Tuke Committee favor parties who sought to settle out West making them more likely to be granted aid, but it was the easiest region to state because no follow-up proof was necessary. Lastly, it is possible that some western-bound families genuinely intended to homestead in the American West— as many Irish immigrants successfully did— but that

⁶⁰ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁶¹ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

the harshness of the climate and vastness of the land proved too unforgiving for some and they were forced to move eastward. Irish historian Fin Dwyer commented on this possibility on an episode of *The Irish History Podcast*. Referencing the Nebraskan frontier of the 1870s and '80s, he explained, “It is hard to imagine the bitterly extreme weather... [and] unrelenting, lonely landscape. In Ireland... temperatures rarely fall far below freezing.”⁶² Interestingly, he also shares multiple interviews and diary entries of Irish immigrants who settled in Nebraska and were frightened by the occasional Aurora Borealis sighting. Without the knowledge necessary to explain the phenomenon, many families took this as an omen to move back to the creature comforts of urban centers.⁶³ Either of these latter theories could potentially explain the reasoning behind the three families that were due West but found along the east coast by 1900.⁶⁴

Unfortunately, due to the vast, sparsely populated nature of the West and the tendency of these immigrants to wind up in locations significantly different than they originally stated, this group was the least likely to be definitively identified in any records. That being said, from the data it appears that in addition to settling in the region that Tuke recommended, these immigrant families were also the most likely to fulfill Tuke’s vision of success for his emigrants. For Tuke, success in the United States meant self-employment in agriculture, home ownership, and a high work output family structure.⁶⁵ Here, it should be emphasized that it was up to Tuke to define what immigrant success looked like, not up to the immigrants themselves. While seemingly

⁶² Fin Dwyer, *Nebraska - Irish Emigrants Surviving on the Frontier*, Irish History Podcast, (March 4, 2019), 11-minute mark.

⁶³ Fin Dwyer, *Nebraska - Irish Emigrants Surviving on the Frontier*, Irish History Podcast, (March 4, 2019), 14-minute mark.

⁶⁴ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁶⁵ Tuke, James H. “Irish Distress and Its Remedies: The Land Question: A Visit to Donegal and Connaught in the Spring of 1880,” (January, 1880), 100.

with the best of intentions, this English Quaker with a passion for philanthropy was single-handedly determining the fates of thousands of Irish families, along with that of their descendants. Presumably, without Tuke's insistence, virtually none of the participating families would have settled in western states, or perhaps even emigrated in the first place. But, would the sustenance farming McManaman family of Denton, Nebraska actually have seen themselves as better off than the stationary engineering English family of Cleveland, Ohio? Was struggling to build shelter and survive in a harsh, lonely environment worth the absence of nativist attitudes? Further, it begs complex questions regarding lack of agency. For destitute, starving Irish families suffering neglect at the hands of their colonizer government, emigration assistance with strict guidelines and qualifiers distributed by Tuke would have been a welcome ticket out of hell. But the agency to choose one's future and lifestyle is also an important measure of success. Therefore, while here, conformity to Tuke's vision is the measure of the quality of immigrant life and their well-being, it is not the only or definitive measure of it.

That being said, of the S.S. Canadian passengers who gave their job title on the 1900 census, only 10% of them held jobs in agriculture. Impressively, the West was home to 100% of those individuals.⁶⁶ And, even more importantly, westerly located immigrants were 5.5 times more likely to own their homes than easterly located immigrants.⁶⁷ Obviously, land was more readily available, undeveloped, and therefore much cheaper in the West which made home ownership easier to achieve than in the congested, urban eastern states. Immigrants in the West were also slightly more likely to

⁶⁶ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁶⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

live in households with a high ratio of working to non-working members. In the eastern states, there was a 60% chance that Tuke immigrant households contained more individuals expected to work (adult men and adolescent children) than not while in the western states there was a 67% chance.⁶⁸ Though only a slight edge, the western families that worked in agriculture were a part of this high work output group which may explain how they were able to sustain their farming lifestyles.⁶⁹

In so many ways, the immigrants who settled in the West represented Tuke's biggest aspirations. But perhaps most important of all was their ability to find—or, in the absence of them, create—meaningful, welcoming communities in their new American lives. Due to their frontier status, outside of a few major urban oasis cities, the western states were mainly home to small towns centered around mining, railroad, and agricultural economies. This, along with the rag-tag nature of the people drawn to the frontier and the abundance of job opportunities which worked to keep anti-Irish sentiments at bay, set the scene for the peculiar phenomenon of tiny Irish towns and villages to crop up across the West. Although more integrated than the Irish neighborhoods of cities like New York, Boston, and Cleveland, these seemingly random towns across the West were often able to create their own immigration chains with Ireland to sustain emigration out of Ireland even after the end of the Tuke Emigration Scheme.

One particular town that at least one group of S.S. Canadian passengers came to call home was Butte, Montana. In the 1870s and '80s Butte was nearly a bustling city complete with commercial breweries, a Chinatown, Scandinavian market district, and one

⁶⁸ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁶⁹ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

of the most popular and longest lasting red-light districts in the country making it a popular travel destination for men of the West, but it started off with much humbler, and much more Irish, roots. Great Famine immigrants were some of the very first to arrive in Butte in the 1850s to begin the hard rock mining that would fuel the country's Industrial Revolution and a few decades later, the demand for copper mining had escalated exponentially. As the demand for miners in the town rose, more and more Irish immigrants came to meet it. By 1900, one quarter of Butte's population of nearly 50,000 was of Irish descent.⁷⁰ In fact, the townspeople even organized Butte's first annual St. Patrick's Day parade in 1882. The Irish counties most popularly represented in the town were Cork, Mayo, and Donegal.⁷¹ The Tuke Emigration Scheme heavily assisted the counties of Mayo and Donegal which may initially explain why several families were drawn to a mining town so far westward and how Irish immigration to the region continued to grow. Clearly an immigration chain between Butte and these Irish counties was established through correspondence shared between family and friends who promised economic success and social acceptance.

Despite the benefits of living in Butte, calling a mining town home came with its fair share of issues. Because the mining companies owned all of the land in their towns, residents had no choice but to rent from the very men who employed them.⁷² And, because of the extremely dangerous nature of the job and the difficulty of unionizing against mining monopolies that paid no interest in the wellbeing of their employees,

⁷⁰ David M. Emmons, *The Butte Irish: Class and Ethnicity in an American Mining Town, 1875-1925*, Urbana: (Univ. of Illinois Press, 1990), 61.

⁷¹ Emmons, *The Butte Irish*, 14.

⁷² Kara Rota, "Butte: Montana's Irish Mining Town," *Irish America*: (September 2010).

many Irish wives were left widowed.⁷³ In order to support their families, it was very common for Irish women in the West to work at lodging houses, as maids, or seamstresses. In fact, all but one female S.S. Canadian passenger who reported holding a job in 1900 was living in a western mining town.⁷⁴ But, due to their mistreatment and large numbers, it was Irish immigrant miners who were able to lead many of the major mining strikes across the West in the towns that they helped to found. Examples include Butte, Montana—which became the epicenter of the Industrial Workers of the World and Leadville, Denver, and Cripple Creek, Colorado—Cripple Creek was the scene of the Great Mine Strike of 1894 which secured an eight-hour workday and fair wages for miners. One-third of the strikers were Irishmen.⁷⁵ While it is unfortunate that Tuke immigrants who settled in western mining towns were subjected to so many hardships and injustices, through unionizing, encouraging friends and relatives to join them, and establishing close-knit, Irish-centered communities, they were able to permanently make their mark on their new homes.

In very similar ways, Tuke immigrants contributed to the non-mining towns they settled in out West. Some locations were large and well-established like Minnesota's Twin Cities, while others were off the beaten path like Liberty, Iowa; Denton, Nebraska; and Grow, Wisconsin to name a few. Depending on the size of the towns by the mid-1880s, Tuke immigrants were able to shape their communities to suit their needs to varying degrees. Virtually all of these communities established at least one Catholic

⁷³ Rota, "Butte," *Irish America*: (September 2010).

⁷⁴ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁷⁵ "Strike Regions More Quiet: Few Disturbances in any of the Mining States. Cripple Creek Deputies Fired Upon from Ambush, but No One Was Hurt -- Tipple Burned Near McKeesport -- Another Ohio Regiment Called Out as a Precaution -- Pennsylvania Operators Divided About Taking Part in the Big Conference," *New York Times*: (June 8, 1894).

parish, contained a branch of the Ancient Order of the Hibernians, hosted annual St. Patrick's Day parades, and even used Irish place names for their own geographical naming systems demonstrating that Tuke was right in his initial sense that his emigrants would be able to easily assimilate out West.

On the opposite end of the spectrum, some immigrants settled expressly where Tuke advised they should *not*. While he was not fond of any eastern location, Tuke particularly feared overcrowded, industrial mill towns steeped in anti-Irish culture. To demonstrate the point, of the 56 families traveling on the S.S. Canadian, only two were headed to the East Coast.⁷⁶ Considering that the vast majority of Great Famine immigrants settled in cities like Boston, New York, and other industrial urban centers along the coast just a few decades prior, Tuke's influence over the futures of his assisted emigrants and future migration patterns is palpable. Therefore, while not representative of a major portion of S.S. Canadian passengers, it is intriguing that one such town, Holyoke, Massachusetts, experienced a rather high spike in regards to stated destination versus location in 1900. Holyoke accounted for only 1.4% of stated destinations but by 1900, 8% of passengers were residing in the city—representing the steepest increase of all stated destinations.⁷⁷ There are several possible theories to account for this spike. Notably, several individuals who reported they were headed to western states ended up in Holyoke by 1900. As suggested earlier, it is possible that some families reported destinations they thought would get them readily selected for emigration assistance rather than risk honestly reporting they wanted to settle in Holyoke. Or, there is at least one instance of a passenger (Patrick McAlpin) who was identified in a Colorado state record

⁷⁶ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁷⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

prior to 1900, but by the census had moved to Holyoke.⁷⁸ Referring back to Fin Dwyer's characterization of Irish immigrant life on the American frontier—it was unrelenting. Surely there were those who gave western settlement their all, but ultimately defected for the comforts of city life back east. And lastly, falling back on Holyoke would have made sense to these immigrants. The mill town was known for its deep Irish history with a population tying back to many counties of Ireland.

Some of the first settlers in Holyoke were Irish immigrants hailing from the western city of Dingle in County Kerry.⁷⁹ In fact, since they made up the majority of the then small town's population, it came to be officially known as Ireland Parish by 1820.⁸⁰ Unfortunately, it did not take long for German immigrants and nativist whites to push the Irish into a district referred to as, 'The Patch' characterized by single room temporary dwellings, unsanitary conditions, and frequent cholera outbreaks. Despite the poor conditions, more and more Irish flocked to Holyoke to assist in damming the Connecticut River and digging its complex canal system. Yet even as the Irish worked so diligently and contributed so greatly in the effort to equip the town with the infrastructure it needed to industrialize, they were marginalized even further. In 1848, the Hadley Falls Company who had initiated the construction to turn the small town into a planned industrial mill city legally changed its name from Ireland Parish to Holyoke to distance it from and essentially hide the reality of the preexisting Irish population.⁸¹ Rather than be deterred, Irish immigrants continued to immigrate to Holyoke and came to represent one-third of

⁷⁸ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁷⁹ Patricia Harty, "Holyoke's Irish Heart," *Irish America*.

⁸⁰ "Timeline of Holyoke, Massachusetts." Accessed March 11, 2021.
https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Timeline_of_Holyoke,_Massachusetts.

⁸¹ Harty, "Holyoke's Irish Heart," *Irish America*.

mill labor, established several Catholic parishes, Irish American organizations, and an annual St. Patrick's Day Parade.⁸²

However, beginning just before the Tuke Emigration Scheme, violence broke out in Holyoke. While they had enjoyed relative peace and even achieved skilled labor status for two decades, a massive influx of French-Canadians to the city in 1880 proved to be a major threat to the resident Irish population. Despite their relatively late arrival, French-Canadians were able to out-compete Irish laborers for better jobs and wages due to their prior experiences with millwork and quickly rose in social standing. They generally looked down upon Irish residents and the tension often broke out into large, violent street fights.⁸³ To Tuke and his committee, receiving bloody reports on Irish immigrant life in Holyoke while they were determining where their emigrants would best thrive, it must have seemed like a dangerous option.

And yet! By 1900, all ten S.S. Canadian passengers that were living in Holyoke were quite well off and seemingly assimilated. Notably, per their 1900 census addresses, they all lived in Holyoke's first ward, known as 'The Flats.'⁸⁴ As previously mentioned, the majority of Irish immigrants in Holyoke lived in 'The Patch' (which was much better off by the turn-of-the-century than it had been in its early, pre-industrial days) or they resided in mill housing which was generally not well-kept.⁸⁵ Meanwhile, The Flats was mostly occupied by French-Canadian and German immigrants who were seen as more

⁸² "Timeline of Holyoke, Massachusetts." Accessed March 11, 2021.

https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Timeline_of_Holyoke,_Massachusetts.

⁸³ Springfield, MA – Our Plural History, "Irish Immigrants in Holyoke," Springfield Technical Community College, 2009.

⁸⁴ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁸⁵ Patricia Harty, "Holyoke's Irish Heart," *Irish America*.

well-off and Americanized at this time.⁸⁶ In addition to their unique residencies, Tuke immigrants in Holyoke were also the most likely to hold positions in skilled occupations. Of only six S.S. Canadian passengers total who reported holding skilled positions in 1900, two of them resided in Holyoke.⁸⁷ The other eight Holyoke residents all held paper mill jobs at one of the factories within walking distance of The Flats.⁸⁸ While the evidence is not overwhelming, it does appear that despite Tuke's warnings, immigrants who found themselves in Holyoke, Massachusetts were able to create relatively comfortable lives for themselves and break away from the set narrative of the larger Irish community there.

After reviewing the trends of the Tuke Emigration Scheme in the United States via S.S. Canadian passenger data, it is possible to compare these outcomes to the outcomes that James H. Tuke published in the years following assisted emigration. Were his emigrants really as well off and well-equipped for success as he had reported,? In 1888 he published a pamphlet entitled, "Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland" in which he provides an update given by Reverend Father Mahony, an Irish Catholic priest in St. Paul, Minnesota who had kept an eye on many Tuke emigrants residing in the Twin Cities and Tuke himself further comments on the status of his emigrants in general. Although writing mostly about the immigrant experience in Minnesota, in many ways the information provided sheds light on families who settled in the relatively similar city of Cleveland, Ohio and other portions are reflective of the scheme as a whole.

⁸⁶ Peter Haebler, "Habitants in Holyoke: The Development of the French-Canadian Community in a Massachusetts City, 1865-1910," *Doctoral Dissertations*: (January 1, 1976), 1118.

⁸⁷ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

⁸⁸ Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

Within the pamphlet, one key assessment made regarding the immigrants' success is their ability to benefit their new communities. Of this, Fr. Mahony notes that at first, the new arrivals were homesick and weary but soon after that, he declared, "I can say they have been lifted to quite a new life, benefited every way, and are right along doing better and better." He further notes that his colleague, perfectly named Bishop Ireland, mentioned, "they have become a most valuable and important addition to the community."⁸⁹ The noted ways in which the immigrants added value to their new communities were filling the endless demand of "common labour for men and boys, and housework for girls."⁹⁰ The pamphlet particularly notes the need for laborers in the blossoming cities of the Midwest because of their population booms and the updated technologies and infrastructure that came along with industrialization.⁹¹ Day laborers were needed to expand city streets, lay sewer, water, and gas pipes, prepare buildings for electricity, and shovel snow in the winters. Although strictly referencing what he had witnessed in the Twin Cities of Minnesota, it is easy to imagine that the 30% of S.S. Canadian passengers who were employed as day laborers in 1900 would have similarly contributed to their communities, even in rural towns.⁹²

Particularly regarding the structure of the scheme itself, Fr. Mahony applauds the results of Tuke's requirement that families have more working than non-working members as he credits it to their ultimate success. He writes, "as none of the emigrant

⁸⁹"Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland," *In Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants*, (1888), 266.

⁹⁰ "Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland," 266.

⁹¹ "Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland," 266.

⁹² Lynch, *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*.

families are without some wage-earners, and most of them have several, they have been taking and saving such sums of money as no outsider could have a notion of.”⁹³ As he describes, it is because of the high-work output requirement that Tuke families were able to save money so efficiently and effectively. Interestingly, he mentions that while families were definitely bringing money in, one would not assume that to be the case based on appearances. As he describes, “the ‘Connemara’s’ home is deceptive. It is often bare, unpartitioned, unplastered, unpapered,” especially in comparison to their German and Polish immigrant counterparts. Further, while a large proportion of Tuke immigrants still rented rather than owned their home by 1887, this was by choice: “They are afraid, traditionally, of putting their savings anywhere but into the stocking or the bank. Being so accustomed to rent, they easily fall into renting still.”⁹⁴ If these observations are true and universal of Tuke immigrants, it makes investigative research into their accumulated wealth and financial well-being even more dependent on the types of archeological digs undertaken by Cleveland State University. In fact, the letter even references the luxury items that Tuke immigrants delighted themselves to: “In even the most poor-looking shanties there are abundant supplies of the very best kind of food: sacks of wheat flour, loaves of the whitest bread, butter, groceries of the primest brand... Not in the best hotels have I been able to sniff the full “Oolong” aroma as from the black porcelain teapots in [their] shanties.”⁹⁵ It is easy to assume Fr. Mahony is hyperbolizing, but according to the dig at the Angle’s Irishtown bend, this is all plausible. Photographs of Irish neighborhoods such as the Angle in the late-nineteenth century portray a rather

⁹³ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 267.

⁹⁴ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 267.

⁹⁵ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 267.

unassuming, plain streetscape and 1900 census records suggest most Tuke families were renters, both typically signs of a lack of wealth. But claims such as Fr. Mahony's, coupled with archeological finds suggesting Irish immigrant homes were equipped with electricity and luxury items provide evidence of a different reality—at least for some households.

In addition to their hard work and potential wealth, Fr. Mahony also applauds the immigration chains started by Tuke passengers, stating, “every year [new Irish immigrants] kept coming on from Toronto and other places in Canada and from Ireland, encouraged by the good accounts and often helped by the prepaid passage tickets of their friends in St. Paul.”⁹⁶ As demonstrated, this phenomenon was not unique to St. Paul. Immigration chains between Tuke immigrants and their relatives across the United States and Ireland were created and many Irish felt more and more compelled to move out west as they received the good accounts from those who settled there. The lasting impacts of these connections have carried into contemporary times. For example, Cleveland's Mayo Society of Greater Cleveland was founded in 2005 to promote research into Irish immigration to America and Irish-American history with an emphasis on Cleveland's connection to County Mayo.⁹⁷ This linkage is even what led to the partnership between the Irish American Archives Society and Ionad Deirbhile in pursuing joint research demonstrating that the Tuke Emigration Scheme impacted generations upon generations of international connections and contributed to a domino effect of further immigration.

While the spurring on of Irish emigration, wealth accumulation, and community contribution are all effects Tuke must have seen as successes for his scheme, the letter

⁹⁶ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 266.

⁹⁷ “Mayo Society of Greater Cleveland,” n.d. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://clevelandmayosociety.org/>.

from Fr. Mahony also hints at some worrisome trends. Rather than outrightly conveying the challenges the immigrants face, the letter poses them as mere suggestions of practices that could be put in place back in Ireland to better prepare families for assimilation into American society. For example, Mahony suggests, “It would add unspeakably to the comfort and the start in life as well as the constant earning-power and the social standing of emigrants if, before leaving Ireland, they were posted on how to do and live and work here.”⁹⁸ He recommends doing so at fairs or church services through simple instructions and demonstrations on how to grocery shop, cook, clean, and essentially perform all household duties in the United States. Most importantly, he notes that, “Scandinavians and others were getting... from two dollars fifty cents up to seven dollars the day, the last for plain brick-setting; two Irishmen were at the painful, dangerous hod-carrying* for only one dollar fifty cents.”⁹⁹ He suggests exposure to hard labor training like how to operate a steam engine in order to give Irish laborers a competitive edge. It is brief mentions like these that allude to a subtle reality that Tuke immigrants were not seamlessly assimilating to American culture. The way they ran their households and their base labor skills marked them as ‘other’ and subjugated them to criticism and lower wages.

In addition to the concerns regarding the maintenance of their homes and low wages, there is also evidence that Tuke immigrants were often suffering from alcoholism, particularly the women. Fr. Mahony believes this tendency is related to the previously discussed issue of housework. Used to the rigorous daily chores of subsistence farming,

*hod-carrying refers to laborers tasked with carrying in supplies to bricklayers.

⁹⁸ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 268.

⁹⁹ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 268.

women who found themselves in urban settings on small plots of land were wanting for activities. Where once they had milked the cows, tended the garden, and so forth, they were now expected to stay indoors. Mahony explains, “Women sometimes fall into the habit of daily beer-parties, for want of something to do... they have settled down into doing nothing, and they stay there.”¹⁰⁰ This issue is compounded by the “all-in-all-ness here [the United States] of sobriety, of total abstinence even” to which he recommends that, “all the drink of the old country ought to be made bitter and nauseous... so as to utterly disgust and wean people from all desire or taste for it... the manufacture of the worthless, mischievous thing should entirely cease.”¹⁰¹ It is perhaps to be expected that a man of the clergy would be so critical of alcohol, but nevertheless it is telling just how adamant Fr. Mahony is in condemning its consumption and even production. In a country moving steadily towards prohibition, the suggestion of regular drunkenness of Irish immigrant wives and mothers was unappealing.

Overall, despite the shortcomings, Tuke had reason to be satisfied with the efforts of his scheme. As evidenced by his pamphlet and its report from Fr. Mahony of St. Paul, S.S. Canadian passenger data analysis, and additional supplementary source material, Tuke immigrants were at least better off than their Great Famine counterparts when it came to wealth accumulation and acceptance. Tribute was even paid to his qualification that emigrating families contain more working than non-working members and there is evidence that this stipulation *did* lead to more stable, reliable incomes. While perhaps not as many families came to own their homes as Tuke would have liked and their homes remained quite drab looking, there is reason to believe that neither of these were surefire

¹⁰⁰ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 269.

¹⁰¹ “Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland,” 269.

signs that the residents were not well off, but simply a cultural carry-over from their old lives. And best of all, those he assisted were likely to recruit friends and relatives still in Ireland to emigrate – a trend that Tuke, a man who firmly believed emigration was the key to the uplift of western Ireland, was surely satisfied with.

Regarding western Ireland, its well-being is also relevant to analyzing the success of the Tuke Emigration Scheme. While families who emigrated escaped starvation and destitution, what became of the tradespeople, townspeople, farming families, and the rest of those who did not receive emigration assistance? Unsurprisingly, Tuke also published a pamphlet on these results entitled, “Further Evidence on Emigration: Showing the benefits accruing to the districts from which the Emigrants were selected.” While the pamphlet itself is rather brief and anecdotal, it does mention that a much more formal case was made by Tuke to the Royal Commission on Public Works in 1888 and that the meeting was well received. This abridged version focuses on a few particular towns to provide concrete evidence of the ways in which western Irish communities were bettered by the scheme. For instance, Tuke mentions Clifden Union, a town in County Galway. Tuke claims that of the 24,000 people residing there, 2,000 were assisted in emigrating and that as of 1888, those emigrants had sent back roughly £8,000, or \$1.5 million in US dollars as of 2020.¹⁰² Distributed among friends and relatives, such a large sum of money must have made a world of difference to starving families struggling to make ends meet. Further, this money was often used to fund the emigration of single persons who had

¹⁰² James H Tuke, “Further Evidence on Emigration,” In *Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of “Mr. Tuke’s Fund,” for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889,* 271 and Webster, Ian Webster, “Inflation Rate in 1888 UK Inflation Calculator,” *CPI Inflation Calculator*, Official Data Foundation, n.d.

typically been left out of the Tuke Emigration Scheme. The pamphlet notes, “A large number of persons are leaving this year (1889) wholly or in part assisted by their friends and 500 emigrants, chiefly single persons, left Clifden Union last year.”¹⁰³ Such a quantity is impressively large considering that with the scheme’s aid, over the course of three years the town was averaging about 667 emigrants a year.

Apart from the money coming in and emigrations continuing out of these towns, the Tuke Emigration Scheme also had illustrated effects on daily life. Tuke references a letter he received from a townsman of Tip in County Belmullet. The man mentions that relieving officers, government officials who enforced evictions, have nearly ceased visiting the area. And, of the 32 houses in the town prior to the scheme, only 12 remain. While at first jarring, the destruction of so many homes allowed for the families who remained to live comfortably; “they have large crops, each man having two and some three even four holdings taken up and added to his own which formerly belonged to our emigrants. The houses are also now nearly all built of stone instead of sod... and are much improved.”¹⁰⁴ Much as Tuke expected, freeing up land holdings in western Ireland gave those who remained in the region the means to expand their farming business and improve their quality of life. Of course, increased agricultural harvests naturally requires a marketplace to sell surplus and make a profit. It is *this* step that Tuke recognized had not been remedied through his scheme.

No matter how many families emigrated from the west of Ireland, the reality remained that there were simply not enough railroads in the region to support commerce. For this reason, by 1889, Tuke had already moved on to his next scheme, a plan to

¹⁰³ Tuke, “Further Evidence on Emigration,” 271.

¹⁰⁴ Tuke, “Further Evidence on Emigration,” 271.

drastically expand the rail system of the Irish west. Tuke recognized that while assisted emigration had remedied the immediate issue of famine and overpopulation in the west, transportation was greatly needed as a means to stimulate the region's economy. He distributed a map displaying the mere 450 miles of rails present in the west, which represented about a sixth of the total amount in Ireland despite comprising one-third of the land and population.¹⁰⁵ His efforts to further advocate for this cause demonstrate that Tuke's Emigration Scheme was not entirely successful at resolving the west's famine, although it was a massively influential first step, and he would not quit until the region's lasting prosperity was achievable.

The Tuke Emigration Scheme was an impressive undertaking by a dedicated English Quaker who genuinely seemed to care about the well-being of western Ireland at a time when its colonizer government did not. And as demonstrated by S.S. Canadian passenger data, the writings of James H. Tuke and his Committee, local historical records of Cleveland, Ohio; the Pennsylvania coal mining region; western states; and Holyoke, Massachusetts, and additional source material, I have made the case that his efforts paid off. While some assisted families strayed from Tuke's vision, several of his requirements such as English literacy and high-work output ensured that they had the tools necessary for relative success no matter the job field or location they settled into. And through those families who did align with his scheme intentions by moving out West, Tuke was able to carve out a new and distinct Irish-American immigration path and narrative. Though not

¹⁰⁵ Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. *Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants:* (1889), 224.

solely responsible for the arrival of Irish immigrants in the American Mid- and Far West, it was due to a single man's insistence and financial sway over starving Irish westerners in search of a new life that Irish migration patterns took a sharp turn. This brief case study of S.S. Canadian passengers leaves the door open to larger undertakings and further inquiry in the future to determine more accurately the fates of the rest of Tuke's assisted emigrants and the scheme's impact on cities and towns across the United States and larger trends of Irish immigration patterns in the United States.

Works Cited

Primary Sources

- Buxton, Sydney C., and Howard Hodgkin. "Mr. Tuke's Fund': Instructions to Relieving Officers in Taking Down Names of Applicants for Emigration." In *Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889., 1883.*
- Cleveland Directory Co. "Map of the City of Cleveland for 1899-1900." Cleveland, Ohio, 1899.
- Hagley Digital Archives. "Commonwealth vs. John Kehoe et Al." Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://digital.hagley.org/islandora/object/islandora:2360241>.
- "Condition of Society in the Coal Regions." *Cambria Freeman*, July 6, 1877.
- Dwyer, Fin. *Nebraska - Irish Emigrants Surviving on the Frontier*. Irish History Podcast. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://irishhistorypodcast.ie/nebraska-irish-emigrants-surviving-on-the-frontier/>.
- Geological Survey of Pennsylvania. "New General Map of the Anthracite Region.: Revised to Date." Harrisburg, PA, 1890.
- "Irish Immigrants: Another Lot of Assisted Passengers Arrive." *Boston Daily Advertiser*. May 11, 1883.
- Lynch, Margaret, Mary Rose Flynn, Erin Kelly, Sean McCarthy, Shane Meehan, and Jacquelyn Wilson. *Tuke Emigration Scheme Data*. November, 2020. Distributed by Irish American Archive Society.
- "STRIKE REGIONS MORE QUIET: FEW DISTURBANCES IN ANY OF THE MINING STATES. Cripple Creek Deputies Fired Upon from Ambush, but No One Was Hurt -- Tipple Burned Near McKeesport -- Another Ohio Regiment Called Out as a Precaution -- Pennsylvania Operators Divided About Taking Part in the Big Conference." *New York Times*. June 8, 1894.
- "The Molly Maguire." *The Pilot*, January 1, 1876.
- "The 'Molly Maguire' Trials." *The Friend*, December 2, 1876.
- Tuke Committee. "Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of 'Mr. Tuke's Fund.'" In *Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating*

to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889. National Press Agency, Limited, 1884.

Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. *Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889.*, 1889.

Tuke, James H. "Irish Distress and Its Remedies: The Land Question: A Visit to Donegal and Connaught in the Spring of 1880," 01 1880. <https://jstor.org/stable/10.2307/60226014>.

———. *James Hack Tuke: A Memoir*. England: Macmillan, 1899.

———. "Report of Success of Emigrants from West of Ireland." In *Tuke Committee*.

"Emigration from Ireland; Being the Third Report of the Committee of 'Mr. Tuke's Fund.'" In Tuke Committee, and James Hack Tuke. Reports and Papers Relating to the Proceedings of the Committee of "Mr. Tuke's Fund," for Assisting Emigration from Ireland, During the Years 1882, 1883, and 1884. Also Report on Distribution of Seed Potatoes in Achill and West of Ireland, in 1886, with Suggestions for Permanent Relief; And Letters From Donegal and Reports of Success of Emigrants, 1889. National Press Agency, Limited, 1884., 1888.

Secondary Sources

"A Remedy for Contagion From the Panic of 1884? Researchers Examine the Effect of Banking Unrest and Subsequent Bailouts During the Panic of 1884." *The Wall Street Journal*, 2016.

"Blacksod Sailings." Accessed March 11, 2021. <http://www.blacksodbayemigration.ie/>.

Burke, Michael. "Immigrant Sweat Built Paper City." American Centuries. Massachusetts Department of Higher Education. Accessed March 11, 2021. <http://www.americancenturies.mass.edu/collection/itempage.jsp?itemid=18754&img=0&level=advanced&transcription=1>.

Byron, William Francis. "Anthracite and the Irish: Extricating the Irish Immigrant Mining Community from the Molly Maguire Myth, Schuylkill County, Pennsylvania, 1850-1879." University of Maryland, 1996.

CFID, Bainisteoir. "Ionad Deirbhile Visitor Centre, Eachleim, Blacksod, Co. Mayo." Accessed March 11, 2021. <http://ionaddeirbhile.ie/>.

- Emmons, David M. *The Butte Irish: Class and Ethnicity in an American Mining Town; 1875-1925*. Urbana u.a: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1990.
- Fitzgerald, Patrick, Christine Kinealy, and Gerard Moran, eds. *Irish Hunger and Migration: Myth, Memory and Memorialization*. West Haven, Connecticut: Quinnipiac University Press, 2015.
- Haebler, Peter. "Habitants in Holyoke: The Development of the French-Canadian Community in a Massachusetts City, 1865-1910." *Doctoral Dissertations*, January 1, 1976. <https://scholars.unh.edu/dissertation/1118>.
- Harty, Patricia. "Holyoke's Irish Heart." *Irish America*. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://irishamerica.com/2009/06/holyokes-irish-heart/>.
- St. John's. "History of St. John's." Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://www.stjohns-creighton.org/history-1>.
- Encyclopedia of Cleveland History, Case Western Reserve University. "Irish," May 11, 2018. <https://case.edu/ech/articles/i/irish>.
- "Irish Famines before 1845 and after 1852." Academic Conference, Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT, June 12, 2019.
- Springfield, MA – Our Plural History. "Irish Immigrants in Holyoke." Springfield Technical Community College, 2009. <http://ourpluralhistory.stcc.edu/industrial/irish.html>.
- Kelly, Mary, and Peadar McArdle. "Historic Mine Sites: Inventory and Risk Classification." Ireland: Office of Environmental Enforcement, 2009.
- Kinealy, Christine, Gerard Moran, and Jason King, eds. *"Fallen Leaves of Humanity": Famines in Ireland Before and After the Great*. Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2019.
- Korson, George. *Minstrels of the Mine Patch: Songs and Stories of the Anthracite Industry*. University of Pennsylvania Press, 1938. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv4w3vzf>.
- Lynch, Margaret. "Leaving Mayo in 1883-1884." In *The Tuke Emigrants*. Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT, 2019.
- . "The Irish and The Angle." Irish American Archive Society, n.d.
- "Mayo Society of Greater Cleveland." Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://clevelandmayosociety.org/>.
- Merry, Mark. *Designing Databases for Historical Research*. 2.0. University of London Press. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://port.sas.ac.uk/mod/book/tool/print/index.php?id=75#ch124>.

- Moran, Gerard. *Fleeing from Famine in Connemara: James Hack Tuke and Assisted Emigration Schemes in the 1880s*. Maynooth Studies in Local History, Number 135. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2018.
- . “James Hack Tuke and His Schemes for Assisted Emigration from the West of Ireland.” *History Ireland*, May 7, 2013. <https://www.historyireland.com/18th-19th-century-history/james-hack-tuke-and-his-schemes-for-assisted-emigration-from-the-west-of-ireland/>.
- . “Escape from Hunger: The Trials and Tribulations of the Irish State-Aided Emigrants in North America in the 1880s.” *Studia Hibernica*, no. 29 (1995): 99-115.
- Ó Luain, Kerron. “‘The Majority of Our People Belong to the Working Classes’: The Ancient Order of Hibernians in the United States, c.1850–1884.” *Social History* 45, no. 1 (January 2, 2020): 52–80. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03071022.2020.1694773>.
- “Our History: Catholic Diocese of Cleveland (Cleveland, OH).” Accessed March 11, 2021. <http://www.dioceseofcleveland.org/about/our-history>.
- Rota, Kara. “Butte: Montana’s Irish Mining Town: Irish America.” *Irish America*, September 2010. <https://irishamerica.com/2010/08/montanas-mining-town/>.
- Sizemore, Zoe. “Irishtown Bend - Excavating an Irish Immigrant’s Life.” Cleveland Historical. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://clevelandhistorical.org/items/show/927>.
- “Standard Occupational Classification System.” US Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2010. https://www.bls.gov/soc/2010/2010_major_groups.htm.
- “Timeline of Holyoke, Massachusetts.” Accessed March 11, 2021. https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Timeline_of_Holyoke,_Massachusetts.
- Varley, Tony, and Fergus J. M Campbell. *Land Questions in Modern Ireland*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016.
- Webster, Ian. “Inflation Rate in 1888: UK Inflation Calculator.” CPI Inflation Calculator. Official Data Foundation. Accessed March 11, 2021. <https://www.in2013dollars.com/UK-inflation-rate-in-1888>.