

James Madison University

JMU Scholarly Commons

Global CWD Repository

Center for International Stabilization and
Recovery

3-2004

Evaluation Report of the Pilot Phase of Project Renew

Consultation of Investment in Health Promotion

Follow this and additional works at: <https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/cisr-globalcwd>



Part of the [Defense and Security Studies Commons](#), [Peace and Conflict Studies Commons](#), [Public Policy Commons](#), and the [Social Policy Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Promotion, Consultation of Investment in Health, "Evaluation Report of the Pilot Phase of Project Renew" (2004). *Global CWD Repository*. 191.

<https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/cisr-globalcwd/191>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Center for International Stabilization and Recovery at JMU Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Global CWD Repository by an authorized administrator of JMU Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact dc_admin@jmu.edu.

***EVALUATION REPORT OF THE PILOT PHASE OF
PROJECT RENEW
"RESTORE THE USE OF LANDS TO THE VIETNAMESE THROUGH
EDUCATION AND NEUTRALIZATION OF THE EFFECTS OF WAR"***



***Submitted by the Consultation of Investment in Health
Promotion (CIHP)***

108 A12 Alley 4/15 Phuong Mai str. Hanoi, Vietnam

Tel: 84 4 5770261

Fax: 84 4 5770260

Email: cihp@cihp.org

March 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. Background	8
1.2. Evaluation objectives	8
1.3. Composition of evaluation team	9
1.4. Methodology and evaluation process	9
CHAPTER TWO: OUTLINES ON PROJECT RENEW	11
2.1. Objectives	11
2.2. Project sites	11
2.3. Project components	12
CHAPTER THREE: PROJECT ACHIEVEMENTS	13
3.1. Towards objective 1	13
3.2. Towards objective 2	16
3.3. Towards objective 3	18
3.4. Towards objective 4	19
3.5. Towards objective 5	20
CHAPTER FOUR: DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSIONS	21
4.1. Relevance	21
4.2. Effectiveness	25
4.3. Efficiency	26
4.4. Sustainability	27
CHAPTER FIVE: RECOMMENDATIONS	29
ANNEXES	32
Annex 1. Term of reference	32
Annex 2. Evaluation Agenda	35

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, the evaluation team would like to thank all mine victims and their families, pupils of primary school, young friends and other project beneficiaries for the sincerity and openness they shared during interviews and group discussions held in their districts and communes. The evaluation team would also like to thank all staff and officers of People's Committees, department of Foreign Affair of Quang Tri province and Trieu Phong District People Committee and concerned agencies at all levels, who had spent their valuable time to share information on the project activities and exchange their views with the team during evaluation visit.

Special thanks are addressed to project coordinator and officers at provincial, district and commune levels for their enthusiastic assistance and support in the meetings with evaluation team to discuss the achievements, favorable conditions as well as difficulties and challenges in implementing the project activities. Our sincere thanks are also addressed to Mr. Chuck Searcy, representative of Vietnam Veteran Memorial Fund for his enthusiastic and open discussions and sharing. All the first-hand information gained from the open discussions with project staff helped the evaluation team establish a comprehensive view on the initial impacts, which the project activities brought about in the project pilot communes. These information also helped identify strategies for further interventions and make necessary amendments to ensure higher effectiveness of the future activities of the project.

We believe that discussions with the evaluation team and this report would be useful for all personnel involved in management, implementation and support of the project activities. The evaluation exercise would have created opportunities for project managers and staff to review the project implementation during pilot phase, the strong points they should keep and the weaknesses they should avoid in order to improve the project activity implementation in the coming period. Since they are the most knowledgeable of the situations, the project staff will be able to make the best use of recommendations in this report that they have come up with while working with the evaluation team.

The evaluation team appreciates all comments and information, which can be addressed to following address:

On behalf of the evaluation team

Do Thi Phuong

Pham Vu Thien

The Consultation of Investment in Health Promotion (CIHP)

108 A12 4/15 Alley, Phuong Mai, Dong Da

Hanoi, Vietnam

Tel: 84 4 5770261

Fax: 84 4 5770260

Email: cihp@cihp.org

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ALS	Asian Landmine Solution
CHS	Commune Health Station
CHWs	Commune Health Workers
DHC	District Health Center
DPC	District People's Committee
MA	Mine Action
MD	Doctor of Medicines
MoD	Ministry for Defense
MRE	Mine Risk Education
MVA	Mine Victim Assistance
RENEW	"Restore the use of lands to the Vietnamese through Education and Neutralization of the Effects of War"
UYA	United Youth Association
UNICEF	United Nation Children's Fund
UXO	Unexpected Ordnance (Bombs, grenades, mortars, rockets, bullets, etc.)
YU	Youth Union
VVMF	Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund (an NGO)
WU	Women's Union

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Quang Tri is one of provinces in Vietnam suffered from severe devastation during the war in 1946 – 1975 period. After Vietnam war, the province still bears great loss in terms of human and material resources due to unexploded land mine and UXO.

For a long post war period, Quang Tri province has placed efforts, together with number of agencies to solve the situation of threatening unexploded landmine and UXO. Among reported efforts, the "Restoring the use of lands to Vietnamese through Education and Neutralization of the effects of the war"(RENEW) project, a product of the partnership between Quang Tri department of Foreign Affair (DoFA)¹ and Vietnam Veterans Memorial fund (VVMF) is designed in order to help solving the above mentioned consequences of the war. The project was implemented from August 2001 to December 2003 in one pilot district in Quang Tri province. Since this is a pilot project with a new model of cooperation between international NGO and local government, after more than two years of implementation, there is a request of local authority and funding agency to conduct an evaluation to assess the implementation of project and provide recommendations to help improve such efforts in coming period. The consultants of Consultation of Investment in Health Promotion (CIHP) were invited to conduct project evaluation. The evaluation employed qualitative research methods and analysis of available data. Other procedures of the evaluation consist discussions and feedback with project managers and officers regarding recommendations for improvements of project implementation and to support possible expansion of the models to other areas in Quang Tri province.

Main achievements:

The objectives, strategies and target groups of the project appear to have been relevant to the needs of people living in the intervention area as well as national strategies regarding humanitarian programmes.

The awareness of target groups, especially children and young people in project district has improved through mine risk education activities in mass media and direct communication programme of youth union and associations.

Mine victims received first aids and medical supports in terms of treatment in health facilities. The victims and their families have access to income generating activities, including mushroom growing, conducted by district peasant's association. Other economic supports brought by the project include credit and saving scheme, managed by women's union. This address women in families with mine victims as they could get better access to loan and improve their household economy.

The RENEW project collaborated with provincial health service in organising two surveys of land mine influences in project district and knowledge – attitude and practice of people regarding mine risks and injuries in whole province. Two survey reports are the first document and data base in this field in whole country, which contribute to socio – economic development strategies of the province in general, as well as further efforts of land mine eradication programmes in coming period.

¹ DoFA now called as Department of Foreign Affair

Capacity of people involved in project management has improved, especially the self – reliant roles of Vietnamese staff in project management and implementation.

The RENEW project helps strengthen the relationships between Quang Tri province and national and international agencies in obtaining more supports in land mine control efforts in particular, and community development programmes in general.

Lessons learnt and issues that require further improvements:

Project document and master plans of project should be developed in a systematic manner and used as effective tool for project management.
Community –based planning approaches and methods should continue to be used in project planning.

Monitoring and evaluation system of project, including monitoring and evaluation plans, indicators, relevant tools for data collection and reporting system should be set up when project starts.

Strategy and plans for sustainability phase should be established in early stage through the utilisation of improved management capacity of staff in pilot phase, the involvement of related sectors and efforts to call for further national and international supports.

The quality of integration of project activities should be improved through a development of specific procedures to include project activities into regular agenda of related sectors and branches. The project should also consider better integration of project activities and models one into each other wherever and whenever possible.

The capacity building activities should continue with a development of master plans of capacity building. Such plan should consider specific skills for staff such as participatory learning and actions (PLA), application of logical framework approach in planning (LFA). There is also a need of training for specialised groups of project, such as group of trainers and supervisors. The capacity building activities should be assessed on regular basis to measure progress of staff capacity and make timely adjustment if necessary.

In efforts of human resource coordination, the project managers should specify job descriptions for each group of project staff and set up specialised staff to make effective use of expertise and avoid workload among key staff members.

The mine risk education efforts should be represented as a comprehensive strategy, which consider a systematic manner of messages communicated through mass media; and integration of education activities in other project activities and models.

In mine victim assistance, the project should have a comprehensive plans of household economic development, which ensure material supply as well as product consumptions. For these activities, the project should continue to work with beneficiaries to develop plans to solve risk-cases and include people with current war waste collection job in programme of support.

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

During the war before 1975, Quang Tri was site of the fierce battles and one of its results, landmine/UXO has still threatened and affected Quang Tri people's lives and local economic development. According to RENEW project survey in 2002, there have been 6,846 reported landmine victims representing 1.12% of the population, including 2,554 death cases, accounted 37.3% of the accidents. In 2003, there were 42 reported land mine incidents, in which 12 were killed. Provincial authorities and people have placed efforts to overcome the consequences of the war, however, this matter requires time and supports from different organizations, including international agencies.

The "Restoring the use of lands to Vietnamese through Education and Neutralization of the effects of the war"(RENEW) project, a product of the partnership between Quang Tri department of Foreign Affair (DoFA)² and Vietnam Veterans Memorial fund (VVMF) is designed in order to help solving the above mentioned consequences of the war. The project consists of several components, which are Mine Risk Education (MRE), Mine Victim Assistance (MVA) and landmine survey. The project was officially approved by Office of Governmental Prime Minister on July 5th, 2001 and started in August 2001. The project was piloted in one district of Quang Tri province (Trieu Phong). Since this is a pilot project with a new model of cooperation between international NGO and local government, after more than two years of implementation, there is a request of local authority and funding agency to conduct an evaluation to assess the achievements as well as limitations of project in order to help improve such efforts in coming period. UNICEF Vietnam had agreed to provide funding for this activity according to the Project Coordination Addendum signed between UNICEF and VVMF in June 12, 2003. The mid-term evaluation is conducted from February to March of 2004. Following are goals and specific objectives of the evaluation, which are stated in the Terms of Reference on January 05, 2004.

1.2. Evaluation Objectives

Goals of the evaluation

- To establish a project evaluation team consisting members of Project RENEW, PACCOM, MoD, DoFA of Quang Tri and an impartial professional evaluation partner (to be chosen by Project RENEW).
- To assess the effectiveness of the project to draw conclusions and provide recommendations.

Specific objectives

- Evaluating the model of Project RENEW as the first comprehensive mine action program managed and operated by the Vietnamese staffs.
- Evaluating the effectiveness of each project component within Project RENEW including the followings:
 - To learn whether programs are producing the desired results.

² DoFA now called as Department of Foreign Affair

- To measure the programs' actual impact onto beneficiaries.
- To learn whether programs' materials are suitable.
- To enhance program recognition.
- To have an early warning to any problem which may arise in coming time.
- Produce final project evaluation report.

1.3. Composition of Evaluation Team

The evaluation team consists two consultants selected by RENEW project and some members of RENEW project, PACCOM Quang Tri DoFA jointly. The members of the evaluation team are:

- Pham Vu Thien, MD. Msc -Consultation of Investment in Health Promotion
- Do Thi Phuong, MD. PhD -Hanoi university of Medicine
- Nguyen Huu Huong, BA- PACCOM
- Hoang Dang Mai - Msc. Quang Tri Acting director of Department of Foreign Affair (DoFA)
- Tran Van Thanh, BA - Trieu Phong DPC

1.4. Methodology and evaluation process

Methodology:

The evaluation employed qualitative research methods, which included in-depth interviews, group discussions, observations and study of available data in order to collect adequate information from different sources. In-depth interviews were held with representative of VVMF, Quang Tri DoFA, RENEW project coordinator and officers, officers from the local government and mass organizations involved in project. These included local People Committee, health sector, and provincial television, Youth Union, Peasant Association and Women Union. The evaluation team spent adequate time to work with project beneficiaries, pupils of primary school, mine victims, and young people who are target of the project.

In order to ensure accuracy of the information collected and improve participation of the project partners in the review of project activity, following each working session with local partners, the evaluation team arranged a debriefing meeting to obtain feedback to validate findings.

Sites:

The evaluation was conducted in Trieu Phong districts of Quang Tri province where the project strategies have been implemented in pilot period. Four communes and town where project is implemented including Ai Tu town, Trieu Hoa, Trieu Thuong and Trieu Dong commune were selected by evaluation team and project officers for field study.

Participants:

A total of 127 people participated in interviews and group discussions in the evaluation. These are:

- Representatives of provincial authority, mass organizations at provincial level, including 6 persons: Quang tri DoFA(1), Health Services (1), Provincial Youth Union (1) and Provincial Television (3).
- Representatives of district authority, mass organizations at district level including 15 persons: Trieu Phong people committee (2), District Health center (1), District Women Union (2), District Youth Union (2), District Peasant Association (2), and district military (6).
- Representatives of commune authority, commune health centers, village health workers, Commune Youth Union, Peasant Association and Women's Union in 4 selected communes including 15 persons.
- Project beneficiaries including 86 persons: pupils of primary schools in Trieu Hoa and Trieu Thuong (61); and mine victims and their families involving in mushroom growing (25).
- RENEW project coordinator and officers (5).

Evaluation process**Process:**

In order to ensure the objectiveness of the information, to collect information from different sources and to build both a broad view and a view with details on the project activities, the evaluation was split up into several phases as follows:

1. Hold discussions with RENEW Project coordinators and officers to identify the objectives and outcomes required for the evaluation.
2. Conduct desk study of available information about the project.
3. Design an evaluation framework.
4. Conduct interviews of officers in charge, project partners at all levels and project beneficiaries.
5. Arrange feedback of primary findings to relevant project partners at all levels after fieldwork.
6. Analyze collected information and prepare a draft report.
7. Finalize the evaluation report.

The evaluation was carried out in February and March 2004, with a one -week time for field visit in project site. A timetable of evaluation activities is included in Annex 2.

CHAPTER TWO: OUTLINE OF RENEW PROJECT

2.1. Project objectives:

Long-term objectives:

- Reduce landmine/UXO accidents in Trieu Phong district, Quang Tri province.
- Support landmine/UXO victims and their families reintegrated in community; support children who are mine victims/children in families of mine victims to be able to go to school and improve their studies in order to have better future.
- Help people feeling safer in living and working. Support local government to identify and prioritize problems, well-coordinating resources for socio-economic development.

Specific objectives

1. Through MRE, increase people's and children's awareness of the dangers of landmine and UXO then support them to have correct behaviors for prevention and solving mine problems.
2. Through program of mines survivor assistance, health assistance to reduce injury and have better health recover; support families of mines victims improving their lives' conditions, create jobs then support them to give up the dangerous work related to mines/UXO.
3. Support Trieu Phong district to build up a map, which identify the locations of mines/UXO as well as their affected levels and impacts to people's lives and development of socio-economic of district.

2.2. Project sites

Quang Tri is a central province of Vietnam, having area of 4,746 km² (475,577 ha) and population of 608,967. It was the location of the former Demilitarized Zone during the Vietnam War and the most contaminated area in Vietnam, resulting in great loss of life and severe destruction of property and the environment. Even today, landmines/UXO still threatens the lives and safety of Quang Tri people.

Trieu Phong district with population of 103,096 is one of the districts, which is most contaminated by landmines/UXO in Quang Tri since this was an area that American army located during war time such as in Ai Tu town, Trieu Thuong, Trieu Ai, Trieu Trach communes. From 1975 up to now, according to the statistics of the district, there were 1,405 landmines victims. The local government has made great efforts in solving this problem. However, there has not been any specific program or activity to support for prevention and control of the landmines/UXO or support for landmines victims due to a shortage of local resources.

Trieu Phong was selected to be a pilot area for implementing RENEW project in phase 1 2001-2003. Phase 2 proposes to maintain the project activities in Trieu Phong and expand to Hai Lang district. The RENEW is the first ever project in Quang Tri province that combine several elements of mine prevention and control programme.

The project also pilots the approach of promoting the role of local human resources in project management.

2.3. Major project components

1. Provide MRE to raise the awareness of people and children on dangers of landmines/UXO.
2. Assist mine victims through providing supports including health care activities, income generating, job training, and provide support to develop new jobs for community people.
3. Build up an overall plan for identifying the effects of landmines/UXO to the development of Trieu Phong district.
4. Strengthen capacity of local staff through project activities and support Quang Tri authority to coordinate activities related to landmines/UXO in Quang Tri.
5. Strengthen and develop the relationships between Quang tri and international organizations; create opportunity for improving mutual understanding, access of funding and other trade commercial investments to province.

CHAPTER THREE: ACHIEVEMENTS OF RENEW PROJECT

Main achievements of the project are evaluated through a) in which context the project achieves its objectives b) the results of project implementation

3.1. Towards objective 1. Improving awareness of local people by Mine Risk Education (MRE)

The improvement of knowledge of people in project area on landmine/ UXO casualty prevention by mine risks education (MRE) was conducted from the end of 2001 to December 2002. The mine risk education activities were divided in to two main channels of communicating to target audiences that involved mass communication by television/ radio programme and direct communication conducted by Trieu Phong Youth Union.

After one and a haft year implementation of the MRE, the data from Knowledge – Attitude – Practice (KAP) survey shows that the awareness of local people on mine prevention improved significantly. Although there was a lack of pre-intervention data, the results of KAP survey shows 93% of interviewed people in Quang Tri and 97.26% of whom interviewed in Trieu Phong had accurate knowledge on the influences of landmine and UXO to human beings. The survey also indicated 82.16% of interviewees of Quang Tri province and 89.42% of Trieu Phong district described correctly practice after seeing/ encountering landmine/ UXO area. There was very few interviewees specified with 5.19% interviewees of Quang Tri province and 3.53% of Trieu Phong district had limit knowledge on how to avoid landmine/ UXO accidents³.

During the discussions and interviews with pupils and local people in Trieu Thuong, Trieu Hoa, Trieu Dong communes and Ai Tu town in Trieu Phong district, the evaluation team recognises that 100% of involved people (that included 61 pupils⁴ and 25 adults) had accurate knowledge on mine prevention.

The MRE on mass media including television and radio programme

The indirect mine risk education with mass media was the products of the collaboration of the RENEW coordination office and the Quang Tri television and broadcasting (QTV). In which, the television mine risk messages were produced and broadcasted from the beginning of 2002 to May 2003 with 14 short messages, 2 long television and 4 short television reportages. In radio programme, the mine risk education was conveyed on 30 programmes that included reportages, news, guest talk and short drama.

The scope of mass media that influences awareness of local people on landmine/UXO was very large. 85.2% and 79.57% interviewees of Quang Tri province and Trieu Phong district received MRE messages through mass media. In addition, there were 87.23% and 91.19% interviewees of Quang Tri province and Trieu Phong district

³ RENEW project - Quang Tri Provincial Health Services 2002. A study of knowledge – attitude-practices to the dangers of postwar landmine/UXO and accidents in Quang Tri province, Vietnam.

⁴ Focus group discussion with 27 pupils at grade 5 in Trieu Thuong primary school and 34 pupils in class 5B Trieu Hoa primary school

appreciated the mass media as the most effective channel for conveying mine prevention messages in Quang Tri⁵.

In the group of local people that involved in the evaluation 100% of adults and 88.24% of pupils presented that they also received mine risk warning on television programme.

The QTV and RENEW project developed each MRE message systematically. The television programmes and MRE messages were developed in details that followed the main steps as i) scenario development, ii) scenario revision and approval, iii) MRE message processing, iv) broadcasting, v) organizing feedback workshop on broadcasted MRE messages with Mine Awareness (MA) instructors and analyzing feedback from audiences (sent to the QTV by mail) in order to revise the MRE messages and vi) revision of the MRE messages and broadcasting again⁶. Beside the main activities, the QTV and RENEW project organized the competition on composing MRE message scripts and the programme had a number of relevant scripts for the MRE programme on television.

The broadcasting activity was conducted regularly 2 times per week on Thursday and Sunday afternoon and repeating in the morning of Friday and Monday. This schedule on television created frequent provision of MRE information on television.

The contents of 14 MRE messages included: i) physical and psychological effects of landmine/ UXO, ii) warning signs of the existing of landmine/ UXO, iii) what should the people do when they discover landmine/ UXO, iv) the need of behavior change toward landmine/ UXO and v) landmine/ UXO warning signs and reporting system⁷. The QTV and RENEW project addressed these MRE messages to target audiences of the programme such as children, farmers and war waste collectors. For each target group, the MRE messages did not cover all of above contents. However, these contents were covered all in the whole MRE programme on television.

The MRE programme on television gained a good impression of most of the audiences through the system of heading, music and MRE contents. 100% of interviewees reported that they spent to see the MRE messages on the television. The evaluation team also met a five year old child who conducted a short role-play for what he saw in MRE messages being showed on the television.

MRE on direct communication channel

The Youth Union was selected to conduct direct MRE to the target audiences through its network. This programme was organized systematically and took full advantages of this organization in Information, Education and Communication (IEC) activities that include: i) Youth Union network is existing at village and commune levels, one of the main tasks of Youth Union is IEC and iii) having strong relationship and network in primary and secondary schools all over the province in general and Trieu Phong district in particular.

The main MRE activities on direct communication are:

⁵ Quang Tri PHS and RENEW project 2002. Knowledge – Attitudes - Practices on Mine risks and accidents after the war in Quang Tri province, Vietnam.

⁶ According to the staff of RENEW project and staff of QTV

⁷ RENEW project – 2001. Guideline for MRE on television.

Setting up 21 MA stations. In which, one station was established in provincial Youth Union office, one MA station in Trieu Phong district Youth Union and 19 others built up in 19 communes of Trieu Phong district. 43 MA instructors also set up who would be responsible for: i) doing counseling on landmine/ UXO to local people, ii) organizing MRE activities in he/ she own commune, iii) organizing the MA activities through a number of movements and advocacy programmes such as festival, landmine/ UXO camp, meeting, parade, photograph gallery on landmine/ UXO prevention and iv) informing the existence of landmine/ UXO by installing warning board. Beside the MA instructors, the network of MA volunteers also set up in the entire primary and secondary schools in Trieu Phong district and this group involved all of the Pioneer Union leaders. The MA volunteers would support the MA instructors in conducting MRE session in their school.

According to the report on MRE activities submitted by the Youth Union and interviewed responsible staff of RENEW coordination office, the project organized 04 training courses on MA for MA instructors and volunteers with 328 person-times. The post-test of these training courses showed that 100% of the MA instructors and volunteers met the criteria of programme on conducting the MRE session.

The MRE programme at community level used variety types of IEC activities and conveyed the MRE messages to target audiences that included following groups: pupils at primary and secondary school, YU members, young farmers, and war waste collectors. The following table showed the main MRE activities on direct communication channel.

Table 1: Main activities and achievements of direct communication on MRE programme⁸:

Activities	Number of events	Total number of participants/ products
Community workshops on MRE (community leaders, local people, war waste collectors, and landmine/ UXO victims)	03	300 person-times
Organizing meetings and parades in 5 district sub-areas (that involved YU members, young people, pupils and local people)	05	4,500 person-times
Landmine/ UXO camps for YU members of 19 communes (that involved YU members, young people, pupils)	04	3,500 person-times
Composing - role-plays – demonstrating of: - Competition of drama, song		120 items

⁸ Youth Union and Youth Association of Quang Tri, 2003. Report of MRE.

Activities	Number of events	Total number of participants/ products
and poem performance		
- Photographs exhibition landmine/UXO		120 photographs
- Pioneer picture competition on landmine/UXO		7,000 pictures
- Composing poem, song and message on landmine/ UXO		4,363 items
MRE among pupils		about 10,000 pupil-times
MRE in meetings of youth union and community	About 600 session	With about 20000 person-times
IEC on MRE in community	304 sessions	15,000 person-times

The result of interviewing 02 MA instructors in Trieu Thuong commune showed that during 2002, they conducted 10 MRE sessions with the participation of about 400 person-times that involved village leaders, representatives of mass organizations and YU members. They also conducted four MRE in primary and secondary schools in the commune. Two MA instructors met and talked with more than 30 of 50 war waste collectors in the commune to persuade them to stop such a job in order to avoid landmine/ UXO casualty.

Beside the MRE activities, the MA instructors also took the role of reporting the existing situation of landmine/ UXO in their commune and installing landmine/ UXO warning board for the local inhabitants according to the information provided by local people. According to RENEW project coordination office, this activity has been done from the beginning of the project to the time that the evaluation took place. There were more than 8,500 landmine/ UXO warning boards delivered to MA stations to all communes and Trieu Phong district. In which, more than 2,000 units were installed in the field.

3.2. Towards objectives 2: Landmine/ UXO Victims Assistances

The Mine Victim Assistances (MVA) included two main groups of activities: i) to support victims and their families in income generation activities that included new job training and supporting them in practising this job, providing women of victim's families credit and saving fund and ii) to provide better medical support to landmine/ UXO victims with emergency and on-going medical treatment.

i) Landmine/ UXO income generation initiatives

a) Training and supporting on mushrooms planting

This programme supported training, facilities, and materials for 100 victim's families in Ai Tu town, Trieu Thuong, Trieu Hoa, Trieu Dong and Trieu Long district in 2002 and 2003 and gained following achievements:

- According to the report of Peasant Association, most of supported families in this programme benefited from this activity and the interest was nearly 100% in comparison with the sum of investments. It means each family had around 1,500,000 VND of interest based on the total supports of the project of about 1,650,000 VND. In Trieu Thuong commune, at the beginning of the programme there were 29 families planting mushrooms in 2002 (in which, 25 families were project beneficiaries) but there was only three families lost and 26 families gained benefits. The interest of each family ranged from 250,000 to 500,000 VND for 500 bags of mushrooms⁹. The average income from mushroom growing of each family was from 2,000,000 to 4,000,000 VND. Particularly one family earned 20,000,000 VND¹⁰.
- A number of families that learned and applied mushroom growing increased significantly. The head of Trieu Phong Peasant Association reported that there were more than 100 additional families starting mushroom growing after this income model was demonstrated without any support of the project. According to the report of Trieu Thuong Peasant Association, in 2002 and 2003 there was 47 new families practised mushroom growing with their own investment. This increased the total of families involved in this income generation model to 72 families.

b) The credit and saving run by Trieu Phong district Women's Union

This activity started in September 2003 with fund and support of RENEW project and the execution of the district Women's Union. Up to present, this activity initially supports 60 women of landmine/ UXO victim's families in Trieu Hoa and Trieu Ai communes.

This activity applied UNICEF credit and saving scheme that presented in southern provinces of Vietnam. The main steps of this scheme were: i) selection of programme beneficiaries (women of landmine/ UXO victim's families), ii) organizing the training on credit and saving and management of the fund for all members, iii) forming credit and saving group and practicing saving, iv) training on income generation activities, v) releasing the fund for group members, vi) monitoring and vii) reporting the programme results to the project.

As starting time of the activity, some initial achievements that reported as:

- The credit fund was released for accurate target group and the borrowers used the credit exactly as a purpose that they committed in their proposal
- The credit and saving activity supported to the advance of woman role in economic development activity of the family by i) being responsible for borrowing the fund, ii) there was no evidence of their husbands influencing of the

⁹ Bag of mushroom is made by nylon that contains sawdust and implant with mushroom yeast.

¹⁰ Trieu Thuong Peasant Association, 2003. Report on mushroom planting production.

use of this fund or using to other reasons and iii) most of the couples had a discussion and agreement in investing the fund for what purpose¹¹.

ii) Medical support for the landmine/ UXO victims

This programme included three main components: i) training on first aids for all commune and village health workers, ii) supporting medical facilities and essential drugs for District Health Center (DHC), Commune Health Station (CHS) and emergency bag for village health workers and iii) ongoing medical treatment.

Trieu Phong DHC conducted two training courses first aids for CHWs and village health workers with the participation of 245 person-times. The training on first aids contributed to the quality of first aids at community level. According to the director of DHC, 100% of village health workers satisfied the posttest criteria of the training programme and a large number of these health workers had chance to apply their knowledge and skills in first aids in taking care of victims of landmine/ UXO and other accidents. In Trieu Thuong commune, the head of CHS reported that after the training course five of ten village health workers had chance to provide first aids for local people, in which two cases were landmine victims and three others were traffic and working accidents. During the interview in Trieu Dong commune, two village health workers also reported that they did two first aids support for local people when they suffered on accidents on-time.

The managers of DHC and commune health workers highly appreciated the support on medical facilities and essential drugs of the project for improving the emergency and treatment of the patients in terms of time and quality. The head of Trieu Thuong CHS reported that all of the medical facilities and drugs supported by the project were utilized and surgical equipments were the most useful among emergency aids for landmine/ UXO and other accidents.

The support for treatment of landmine/ UXO victims was conducted at DHC and provincial hospital. Though the support has just initiated (after this activity started only two cases had the supports in DHC) with only 300,000 VND for each case, it helped the victims and their families reduced their economic problems on covering the cost for treatment at the hospital¹².

3.3. Towards objective 3: Mine Action Coordination (MAC)

The MAC and development of master plan for measuring the impact of landmine/UXO was taken place with two surveys: i) Landmine/UXO impact survey in Trieu Phong district, Quang Tri province Vietnam and ii) Knowledge – Attitude – Practices on landmine/ UXO risks and accidents after the war in Quang Tri province, Vietnam. Based on the results of two surveys, RENEW project had relevant information to support landmine/ UXO prevention activities of Trieu Phong district in particular and Quang Tri province in general. The main contributions of MAC were:

The report on landmine/UXO impact survey in Trieu Phong district, Quang Tri province Vietnam has a practical effect for strategic planning for social economic development of the district. According to the vice chairman of Trieu Phong District People Committee (DPC), on the basis of accurate information of landmine/ UXO

¹¹ Interview with chairwoman of Trieu Phong WU.

¹² Interview with director of Trieu Phong DHC.

victims and the existence of landmine/ UXO in each area, the district would be able to compose a detail plan for restoring land use and economic development in the whole district.

The report on Knowledge – Attitude – Practices on landmine/ UXO risks and accidents after the war in Quang Tri province, Vietnam was a first of KAP survey that was conducted in large scale in Vietnam on landmine/ UXO risks and accidents. The report contributed to the measure of the knowledge, attitudes and practices of local people¹³.

In information and MAC, RENEW project also developed information based on two above surveys results. The information helps to prioritize the intervention and community development activities that will be implemented in project area. A strong information management software is used to maximize an utility of the information. A website on landmine/ UXO in Vietnam was also developed. This activity has just started and supported similar projects and programmes, departments in Quang Tri and central level information on landmine related issues. The information activity also helped communicating the voice of Vietnam on landmine/ UXO related issues to international arena.

3.4. Toward objective 4: Capacity building¹⁴

Capacity building for staff at provincial level and RENEW project coordination office were mainly realised through ‘learning by doing’ and working together with ALS experts. At commune and district levels, the capacity building activity was conducted through training and supervision of the experts and provincial staff.

Capacity of the staff involved in the project was improved significantly after participating to the project. Following achievements should be highlighted in the context of pilot phase: i) not much time budget of 2 years for project implementation; ii) first piloting the active management of local human resources and iii) having just certain support from international experts (who came in 03 visits, in which the longest period was 5 months working with local project staff).

To the staff of RENEW project coordination office and provincial level, main improvements of capacity were shown through:

- Making the action plan for specific activity in their working area, coordinating the participation of related organizations and individuals at different levels in the activity
- Drawing lessons learned from the previous phase of the project. During the discussion with the evaluation team, the staff of RENEW project presented a number of limitations in the piloting project especially in planning, implementing and monitoring of the project such as lacking of master plan for the project, the project monitoring and report system was not well set up and provide good evidences for proving the project achievements.

¹³ According to the director of Quang Tri Foreign Affair department

¹⁴This objective is not stated in the objectives of the project documents but it is presented as the main component of the project

- Developing small interventions and projects to have additional funding for related intervention of RENEW project. This is a new skill of the project staff that they could not do before their participation in the project.
- Utilizing project facilities to maximize their capacities to support the project activities and overcome the lack of human resources of the project (03 project staff)

To district and commune levels

The staffs of Trieu Phong Peasant Association and YU are able to organize and conduct training in the issues that they work in. The secretary of Trieu Phong district YU reported that three staff of district YU is able to conduct specific topics on MRE for MA instructors and according to the project staff this ability was build up after these YU staff involved in the project and learned from the experts and foreign trainers.

The capacity of the project beneficiaries presented by i) the active reporting of the existence of landmine/ UXO to MA instructors requesting the collection of these landmine/ UXO, ii) the beneficiaries of mushroom growing being able in coaching and supporting other villagers in practicing this occupation as Mr. Vi in Trieu Thuong commune, who trained and supported three neighbors in mushroom growing.

3.5. Towards objective 5: Strengthening the relationships between Quang Tri province and international organizations and NGOs¹⁵

According to 2003 annual report, the RENEW project had conducted an enhancement of relationships as stated in above objective in a systematical way since the beginning of the project with the contribution of VVMF and RENEW project coordination office. In 2003, there were 32 domestic and international delegations with 164 visitors who came to learn about the project and explore collaboration in landmine/ UXO related issues and community development.

The relationship between RENEW project in particular, Quang Tri province in general with organizations and departments at central and international levels was improved significantly by the active and collaborations between RENEW project office and VVMF in Hanoi. The VVMF and PACCOM representatives appreciated the achievement of this activity. Through out a provision of information about RENEW project, Quang Tri contributed to build up a good impression of landmine/ UXO action in Vietnam especially MRE and victims assistances and it also contributed to the motivation of more funding for Vietnam to overcome problems and reduce the risks of landmine/ UXO.

¹⁵ This objective is not stated in project documents but it is presented as the main component of the project

CHAPTER FOUR: DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

4.1. Relevance

This evaluation analyses the relevance of project objectives, strategies and its consistence to the overall orientation and strategy of the country.

4.1.1. The project objectives appear to be relevant as the project aims to meet real needs of people in project area as well as whole province. The objectives are established to guide a rather comprehensive project in the area of mine risk prevention, which includes following components: i) mine risk education, ii) mine victims assistances, and iii) mine action coordination.

It is obvious that the needs of improving knowledge of people about land mine are of great importance. Such needs are more urgent among groups of children and young people, who do not have enough experience of direct contact with killing weapon. These groups also lack of knowledge about risks of unexploded ordnance (UXO) scattering their areas as well as risk of exploitation and induced casualties. These facts confirm that having a project, which aims at raising awareness and improving knowledge and practice of people towards mine prevention and control is a relevant strategy, especially a large budget of time and finance are needed to cover mine scanning and destroying. The project is useful programme in instructing local people living, studying and working in landmine/UXO contaminated area.

The objectives of supporting emergency activities, treatment of mine injured people as well as assisting these vulnerable groups to improve quality of life through development of household economy are necessary. The direct support provided to victims of mines, especially to a group of people relying on a job of war waste collection would help them improve their incomes as they could early leave their current life-threatening jobs.

According to the department of foreign affairs of Quang Tri province, there are a number of organizations and branches involved in mine control programmes in the area. Aiming at a comprehensive mine action coordination is likely a relevant strategy, which would help coordinate different resources of these programmes and make them be more effective to meet the needs of people.

There is a mention of needs, which should be considered in coming period is land mine/ UXO collection and management. This has not been included in current project period due to limited financial resources. However, the evaluation team agrees that is also an issue of urgency, which could help restore cultivated lands and every day life of local people. In the pilot phase, the project conduct MRE and community mobilization on reporting existing landmine/ UXO while the project still seeks for the support of mine scanning and destroying and complete the model of a comprehensive mine action programme following the guideline of United Nation¹⁶.

4.1.2. Relevance of project strategies:

In current period, RENEW project applied the community-based approach, which appears to have been relevant. This includes i) exploration of community needs

¹⁶ Following "Mine action and effective coordination: The UN policy at a glance".

through community visits and meetings before project action undertaken, and ii) mobilization of related sectors and beneficiaries in project planning and implementation.

Capacity building is included in project objectives, which proves to be a right strategy in providing enough basis for future sustainability of project efforts. The evaluation team strongly supports the continuation of capacity building strategies in coming period, so that the project activities and achievements could be managed in a long term with local human resources.

There is no doubt that mine risk education and communication appears to have been relevant and necessary in improving knowledge of people towards mine risk prevention and control. This strategy would become more needed to help deal with mine risks among groups of children and young people, who have less experience and knowledge of mine risks and consequences as well as necessary risk reduction measures.

The evaluation team recognizes another relevant strategy of integration and use of local resources in mine risk control efforts applied in project. Apart from the sense of having qualified human resources for sustainable programmes in future, this strategy would help provide an overall orientation of local sectors and branches towards common efforts of mine risk control.

4.1.3. Selection of project area and target groups:

In the opinion of evaluation team, Trieu Phong appears to have been relevant selection for project intervention. This district meets required criteria related to a serious status of mine risks, the needs of support of community people and potential involvement of local committees and branches. The target groups of project include children and young people, farmers, people with wastage collection job and victims of mine, who are vulnerable to information, mine induced injury control and treatment as well as economic development.

4.1.4. Relevance to the overall orientation and strategy of the country:

Currently, there is a encouragement of a countrywide policy orientation of integrating project funded by international donors in Vietnamese sectors' activities. This encompasses capacity building strategy and handing over project management responsibility to Vietnamese counterparts¹⁷. In the opinion of evaluation team, the RENEW project places a right step in creating necessary conditions for integration of project activities and components to support the target groups. The same recognition is evident with the fact that project is managed by Vietnamese counterparts, who gradually strengthen their capacity of project management. These two main efforts are consistent with an overall orientation of Vietnamese government and responsible ministries and PACCOM.

4.2. Project document and planning process

In the opinion of evaluation team, there is a need of more detail project document. The current one looks more like a summary proposal, which states a rationale of

¹⁷ Interview PACCOM programme manager

project, objectives, results, main activities and an analysis of project effectiveness. It is necessary to discuss following points related to project document:

There is an observed lack of required consistence between project components, including project objectives – outputs and activities. The evaluation team sees this as one difficulty to both project management as well as evaluation of precise level of project success. In more concrete term, there is a lack of precision in stating project components, for examples, lack of specifically stated activities as currently stated look like a group of activities. Another important component of project monitoring and evaluation, including indicator system and methods for measurements are not present in project document. This would create difficulty in establishing clear monitoring and evaluation activities, which subsequently prevent project to prove its effect and impact on target groups and specific beneficiaries. The evaluation team does not see a clearly stated organization and coordination framework of the involvement of local sectors and branches in project document.

Planning exercise and methods:

During the project, the planning process that includes particular steps were used such as needs assessment, participatory planning. However, the existing methods used in needs assessment (such as community meeting and consultation) did not maximized the active participation of local people in exploring and analysing the needs and discussing on relevant solutions for the project.

The main difficulties for this problem related to the lack of human resources, overwork of key persons of the project that will be presented in the discussion of capacity building session.

4.3. Project monitoring and evaluation system

The Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system did not well set up so that it limited the ability to monitoring and evaluating the project progress and it was also preventing the project to present the achievements of the project. A good M&E system also contributes to the revision of the project activities in order to achieve the project objectives.

4.4. Integration of project activities in regular activities of local sectors and branches

It is important to confirm that project has a relevant strategy to involve different sectors and branches in project activities, considering the strengths and expertise of these parties in different fields. This effort would save resources, make a maximum use of sectors' expertise and increase the sustainability when external support ends. Examples are integration of education efforts in youth union activities, involvement of peasant's association in economic development and credit and saving activities are cooperated with women's union.

Another discussion relates with the question of making use of conditions of integration to maximize the effectiveness of project activities. It is obvious that project established different groups of beneficiaries, including households involved in mushroom growing, women in credit and saving groups. These groups hold regular meetings to discuss and help the members obtain experiences and new information in

farming and increase their access to credit. The results of MRE would be increased if landmine/ UXO prevention topics were frequently discussed in the existing groups in the project area.

4.5. Capacity building for staff involved in project management and resource coordination

4.5.1. Capacity building

As described in section 1 chapter 3 of this report, capacity building is one important strategy, highlighted in project document. The evaluation team, however feel necessary to discuss following points in line with capacity building: i) plan of capacity building, ii) capacity building activities and evaluation of capacity building.

Plan of capacity building: The above strategy of capacity building should be specified with a clear, formally set up plan of capacity building for project staff at different level. In the opinion of the evaluation team, such a plan should indicate expected results of capacity building activities, how to achieve these results and the ways to evaluate these outcomes.

Capacity building activities: Due to characteristics of the pilot phase, capacity building activities are mainly undertaken through learning from experience in concrete activities of the project. For project staff, there are further needs of systematic capacity building activities in terms of required knowledge and skills of: i) need assessment, ii) planning and strategic planning, establishment of monitoring and evaluation system and supportive supervision. Regarding staff responsible for education and communication, there is a need of improving their capacity in training needs assessment, active training methodology, education and communication.

The supervision was normally conducted in the field visit of the staff of each project party and in fact these supervision look likely as monitoring work and it did not make a great contribution to the improvement the performance of project participants at community level. The limitation in supervision is influenced by the limited human resources involved in supervision compared to people who need to be supervised in such a large area like present.

Evaluation of capacity building activities: Almost all interviewed managers of province, VVMF office in Hanoi and related departments at central level mentioned the improvements of capacity of project staff. They also highlighted the success of having qualified staffs remain to work in Quang Tri province after a phase of external funding. Nonetheless, such success could have been thoroughly assesses if the project has a master plan of capacity building and indicators to provide precise evaluation of results of capacity building activities.

In opinions of evaluation team, the master plan of capacity building must have been established at the inception of project as one important component of project plan. Such plan should contain a selection of capacity building approach and relevant activities, specified for capacity building of different groups involved in project. In parallel, the capacity building activities should be evaluated in a systematic manner using appropriate indicators. Such evaluation would contribute to improve the quality and results of capacity building efforts over time.

4.5.2. Human resource management and coordination

The evaluation team recognises the independent and self-reliant nature of Vietnamese staff in project management and human resource coordination. This is evident at national and international levels through efforts of project managers and staff in communicating the project to get more concerns and supports from different agencies. At local level, there have been initial efforts of mobilising relationships to make the best use of human resources, available among related sectors and branches in communes, district and province.

Nonetheless, due to the characteristics of pilot phase, the management and coordination of human resource in RENEW project also faced following challenges:

- i) the project has not established groups, responsible for each technical area. Examples of such groups are group of trainers and supervisors. Lack of such groups created an workload among certain project staff, meanwhile, the project could not maximize the other available human resources. For instance, due to a lack of formal group of trainers, the staff of RENEW project office and international experts must take such role in mine risk education programme. The workload has been observed in supervision activities as mentioned in mushroom growing area in above section.
- ii) another limitation, which influenced the human resource management and coordination was a lack of clear task description among staff involved in the project implementation.

The above difficulties restricted a maximum utilisation of human resources and reduction of workload for key staff in project management.

4.6. Effectiveness of some key activities of project

4.6.1. Mine risk education

Specific strategy, which should consist i) specific objectives of the activity, ii) main contents of education, iii) target groups and communication channels, appropriate to these groups, and iv) coordination mechanism and synchronization of communication channels to help maximize the effectiveness of education programme. Overall observations did not indicate appropriate coordination and synchronization of two likely separate mine risk education, through mass media and direct communication in community.

4.6.2. Support to economic development of families with mine victims

In opinion of evaluation team, such support is a relevant strategy with potential for further expansion in the areas of mushroom growing and household husbandry. This point is in line with other enabling factors, including consumption, characteristics of work, efficient utilization of labor force in farming or animal husbandry, and overall strategy for economic development of project district as well. Specifically for the last point, there is clear evidences of district's support when Trieu Phong district people's committee decided to i) create conditions for target groups to access loan with low interest (0.5%/ month) and loan sized 1 – 1.5 million VND/ household; and ii) provide additional fund of 1 million VND/ 4.5 – 5 million VND total investment for one mushroom steam sterilizing room.

Some implicit questions:

The absence of master plan of economic development of families with mine victims: the evaluation team could not find evidence of such plans for each area like mushroom growing for coming 1 – 2 year period. To certain extent, this situation prevents success of economic development activity as well as conditions for expansion. Taking mushroom growing as an example, due to the absence of master plan, supply of raw material and contracting the product have not been fulfilled in harmonious manner. As result, it limits number of households who could be involved in above activity, even though there are a large number of candidates.

Risks:

Discussion of risks relates with maintenance and expansion of people involved in household economic development. Regarding households receiving loan for animal husbandry there would be a risk of animal death, as results, these families get into debt. Similar risk would occur with households getting involved in mushroom growing. This poses a question of having strategy to support target families when they lose their business, besides commitment of loan return.

4.7. Efficiency

Discussions of the efficiency of RENEW project implementation and management include a review of human resources, equipment, time and budget.

To assess the efficiency of utilization of human resource, the evaluation team reviews the qualification, experience and time allocation of consultants (both expatriate staff of ALS and national consultants) in meeting the needs of project implementation and management.

As technical supporting agency, ALS sent consultants to train local project staff on mine risk education. It is reported that ALS has relevant experience in organizing training on mine risk education and other interventions in this field. All interviewed attendants of these training courses reported their own assessment of high-qualified consultants of ALS as well as experience of these consultants in Asia. The interviewed trainees also highly appreciated training methods of ALS consultants. Other evidences of reviewed training and IEC materials support this assessment of both interviewed staff and evaluation team.

The project also involved national consultants from Hue medical school, district health centre, and provincial military office to support training and survey activities. Interviewed project staff at different levels also mentioned their satisfaction of qualification of these consultants as well as their quality of work.

In the opinion of evaluation team, strategy of involving Vietnamese staff in project management, maximizing the use of national consultants and involving expatriate advisers on short –term basis when necessary should continue in coming period. Such strategy has contributed to increase efficient use of project resources, without affecting the quality of project activities.

Regarding the use of project equipment, the results of interviewed beneficiaries and evaluation team’s observations show that project have maximized the use of equipment for project activities. Infrastructures and facilities like steaming room, carpenter’s shop to supply sawdust for mushroom growing have been used by families with a maximum capacity. Similar is utilization of medical equipment for first aid

activities. The staff at commune health station and village health workers reported their use of project supported facilities and equipment for all emergency case at commune health station and in villages.

The evaluation team recognizes that mine risk education activities produced satisfactory IEC materials, such as education messages, reportages, and training materials. These document could be re-used in appropriate conditions. However, most of these materials have not been used with a maximum capacity due to a lack of systematic plan, which states how these materials would be used in sustainability period.

In principle, assessment of cost – effectiveness should be considered in project evaluation. For examples, it is useful to assess if models of mine risk education, mushroom growing and animal husbandry and integration these two main activities appear to have been cost – effective. Nonetheless, it is not feasible to have enough inputs to measure this criterion, at the point of evaluation. It is recommended to plan for cost – effectiveness assessment if the project considers expanding its models in coming period.

4.8. Sustainability

Up to the time of evaluation, the project has just completed the first two year implementation, thus, it is still early to have a full assessment and final conclusion of project sustainability. Nevertheless, there is an evidence showing that sustainability is considered at early stage of project design. This is stated in project document as “project should maintain activities through building capacity of local staff, then they could continue to use project supports to maintain and expand activities when external supports end”¹⁸.

Most of the evidences are included in chapter three as project provided training courses on skills of mine risk education, first aids for mine injuries and extension skills in mushroom growing and animal raising. In strategic terms, these courses contribute to improve capacity of both project staff and beneficiaries, who would play a role in sustainability phase.

Another factor influencing the capacity building of local staff is a delegation of management responsibility to Vietnamese cadres. This approach helped create opportunities for Vietnamese staff to work in more active and responsible manner. All interviewed project staff mentioned that they must have been active in learning and placed efforts to meet the demand of work. These staff also reported that they feel more and more confident to manage similar activities by themselves in coming period. Similar assessments came from interviews with VVMF representative and provincial leaders. It is logical to say that above improved capacity of project staff can be seen as one of important enabling factors to contribute to sustain project activities when external supports end.

Some difficulties in sustainability:

The difficulties includes finance for conducting mine collection or scanning and destroying in order to ensure the save life for local people and serve for development objectives of the local authority such as migration, resettle the local people and

¹⁸ Project document

planning for economic and social development of the area. To implementing this component was not only exceed the ability of local financial resources but also the ability of RENEW project. In order to fulfill this component RENEW project in particular and Quang Tri province in general need the support of both national and international organizations.

Difficulties of human resources: At the end of pilot phase, the number of project staff who were able to fulfill specific tasks was still limited (discussing on the session of human resources development), therefore the project tasks mostly allocated to the project key persons and caused the overwork for these people. During the sustainability phase, when the key persons reduced their involvements in the project due to objective reason of human resources allocation in their organization while the capacity of subordinate staff still limited so that the results of project activities would be influenced.

Difficulties in understanding and perspectives of organizations and local people involved in the project in terms of sustainability: The perception of project is an one off activity and putting sustainability out of the project cycle are still dominate the way of thinking and contributing to the project of staff and people involved in the project. Consequently, the preparation for sustainability such as planning, human resources arrangement, commitment on sustainability between sector, department and organization and finance (revolving funds, saving or investment) did not have relevant consideration.

CHAPTER FIVE: RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Project document – basis for effective implementation and management of project activities

The project staff should develop a systematic project document, which include:

- 1.1. Problems analysis, stakeholders and risks analysis. These sections will help establish other components of project on logical basis.
- 1.2. Main components of project **objectives** (short and long – term), which should be specific, measurable, attainable, realistic and time achievable; **expected outputs; main activities; inputs; monitoring and evaluation system** (consists indicators and methods and tools to measure these indicators); **detail activity and budget plans.**

2. Master plan of project – basis for implementation and monitoring of project activities

- 2.1. The staff of RENEW project and related sectors and branches at different levels should develop a **master plan of project and together make revisions of project plan** (if necessary). Such revision of plans should consider the project implementation of previous period, any problems emerged and factors related to resources of project.
- 2.2. In order to establish an effective master plan, the staff of project and related sectors and branches should conduct a participatory assessment of community needs at early start of project. The exercises of needs assessment should include prioritization of community needs and solutions as well as supports required to build up a feasible plan of community based intervention.
- 2.3. The project should continue to employ a community – based approach in planning activities of project. Besides current methods, the project could consider other tools of planning, for example, employing logical framework approach (LFA) to maximise a logical and systematic relations between components of project plans.

3. Monitoring and evaluation system – required component to ensure project success

- 3.1. Monitoring and evaluation system of project should include relevant indicators, tools for data collection and analysis and reporting system at each management levels and between these levels. The monitoring and evaluation system should be able to function at the beginning of project implementation.
- 3.2. Staffs involved in monitoring in each field of activities should be established with clear task description to make sure that information is updated for management purposes.
- 3.3. Relevant reporting system and procedures should be available on regular basis, especially in a period of project after external supports end.

4. Combination of project activities in working agenda of local sectors and branches

The project should continue to strengthen the collaboration with related sectors and branches in project implementation and management through:

- 4.1. Provincial people's committee, department of foreign affairs and project office should discuss and agree with related sectors and branches to include project activities in their regular working agenda. These sectors and branches should consider allocating staff to manage the project activities, which belong to their responsibility.
- 4.2. The project office and related sectors and branches should develop detail document as guidelines to integrate project activities in sector's working agenda.
- 4.3. The project staff should discuss with groups of beneficiaries to better integration of project activities, such as a combination of mine risk education in regular activities of credit and saving groups or production team in project areas.

5. Capacity building for project staff

The project office, provincial people's committee and related sectors and branches should consider following revision in capacity building strategy of the project:

- 5.1. To develop a detail plan of capacity building, which should state objectives of capacity building, expected outputs of different target groups, strategy and specific methods to achieve these results.
- 5.2. The staff involved in project management at all levels should receive more training and support in terms of skills of needs assessment (for example, participatory learning and actions - PLA), planning (for example, Logical Framework Approach - LFA), monitoring, supervision and evaluation, development of project strategies – with focus on strategies of community education and development.
- 5.3. The staff involved in concrete activities should improve specific knowledge and skills, for examples, active training methods for group of trainers as well as methods for monitoring and evaluation of training programme.
- 5.4. The project and related sectors and branches should develop detail plans of supportive supervision for each field of activities. Such plans should include who should be supervisors and for whom, what to be supervised, tools for supportive supervision and detail tasks allocation in supervision plans.
- 5.5. The project and related sectors and branches should consider organizing regular evaluation with regards to capacity building, for example once every year in order to determine if the staff capacity meet the project requirements and make necessary revisions of capacity building activities.

6. Management and coordination of human resources

- 6.1. The project and related sectors and branches should agree on clear tasks and responsibilities for each posts of project management and implementation. Such

task description should be based on specific task analysis of these staff. The task analysis should also be used as basis to develop plans of capacity building.

- 6.2. The project and related sectors and branches should consider the establishment of 'technical groups of project', such as group of trainers and group, responsible for monitoring and supervision. The presence of such groups would help improve quality of specialised activities as well as to avoid an workload and overlapping among staff involved in these activities.

7. Mine risk education

The project and provincial television, youth union and youth league should continue to implement mine risk education with a focus on following:

- 7.1. Development of detail strategy of education and communication, which should contain specific objectives of education, main information, target groups and relevant communication channels and possible ways to combine these channels for resonance effect of communication. For examples, message in television could be transferred to a topic of group discussions among target groups at community levels.
- 7.2. Development of education messages in a systematic sequence, which would help increase the access and acceptance of target groups to these messages and information.
- 7.3. Direct education and communication for selected target groups should be conducted on regular basis.

8. Assistance to mine victims and their family in economic development

- 8.1. The project and related sectors and branches should develop a comprehensive plans of economic development with an active participation of beneficiaries. Such plans should consider carefully important issues, including supply of raw materials, support to production process and product consumption. There should be a written commitment and clear task allocation between parties involved and beneficiaries.
- 8.2. The project and related sectors and branches should discuss possible risks of economic development activities with beneficiaries and make agreement on how to deal with problems when risks occur. Such agreement should state clearly the roles and responsibilities of each party as well as the way to support beneficiaries to recover production and settle their economic life.
- 8.3. The project should consider war waste collectors as one of target groups to receive economic support, which could help these people gain better income and withdraw their current vulnerable jobs.

ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE

Project RENEW Coordination Office

PROJECT EVALUATION

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. Introduction

"Restoring the use of land to the Vietnamese through Education and Neutralization of the Effects of the War" -- Project RENEW is the first integrated and comprehensive mine action program to be launched in Vietnam, initially focused in Trieu Phong District, Quang Tri Province, the location of the former Demilitarized Zone during the Vietnam War and the most contaminated area in Vietnam.

Project RENEW is sponsored by the Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund, in partnership with the Quang Tri Province People's Committee. The project is divided into three major components: Mine Risk Education (MRE), Mine Victim Assistance (MVA) and a Coordination Office. Project RENEW was officially approved by Office of Governmental Prime Minister on July 5th, 2001. Project RENEW started in August 2001 and is operating in Trieu Phong District, one of seven districts of Quang Tri Province.

Since this is a pilot project with a brand new model of cooperation between international NGO and local government, after more than two years of implementation, it is requested by the local authority and donors to begin an evaluation program to assess the effectiveness of the project for the future developments. UNICEF Vietnam had agreed to provide the funding for this activity according to the Project Coordination Addendum signed between UNICEF and VVMF in June 12, 2003.

2. Goals of the evaluation program

To establish a Project Evaluation Team consisting members of Project RENEW, PACCOM, MoD, DoFA of Quang Tri and an impartial professional evaluation partner (to be chosen by Project RENEW).

To assess the effectiveness of the project since its beginning in the province to draw conclusions and provide recommendations.

3. Specific objectives

Evaluating the model of Project RENEW as the first comprehensive mine action program managed and operated by the Vietnamese staffs.

Evaluating the effectiveness of each project component within Project RENEW including the followings:

- To learn whether programs are producing the desired results.
- To measure the programs' actual impact onto beneficiaries.
- To learn whether programs' materials are suitable.
- To enhance program recognition.
- To have an early warning to any problem which may arise in the time coming.

Produce final project evaluation report.

4. Contents to be accounted in the project evaluation

Engaged stakeholders:

Project RENEW will seek a skillful and capable independent professional evaluating team to be the main partner for the evaluation program. During the evaluation period, members of PACCOM, DoFA and Provincial authority will also participate to ensure the reliability and scientism of the program. The program can also have the participations of other local partners at the specific requests of the program designers.

Once Project RENEW and the independent evaluating partner reach a mutual agreement on the methodology, implementation and budget, a contract will be signed.

Designing and implementation of the study:

Independent evaluating partner will be required to suggest suitable methodology and produce a completed designing for the evaluation program to fully implement all necessary evaluating procedures. The implementation of the evaluation program will be assisted by Project RENEW and all other stakeholders as necessary.

Application of final evaluation results:

A final report is expected to be produced and to serve as a tool to determine future implementation of the project. Additional relevant software, materials may be requested to be built up or provided to ensure later use of the evaluation results at project office.

5. Specific requests for independent evaluating team

Being experienced in implementing program evaluation and research.

Fully meet the requirements of ability and capacity.

Responsible for the designing and implementing of the program.

Ensure the provision of professional expertise during the implementation.

Ensure the designated end-results are to be produced and applicable for the project.

Appointing one staff to be the contact person with Project RENEW

6. Time of implementation:

To be framed in details by the independent implementing partner; however, it is compulsory to complete the program before 15/3/2004.

7. Budget:

Program budget is expected to be decided base on the actual design of the evaluation from the independent implementing partner and with the consensus from Project RENEW.

Contact person:

Hoang Nam - Project RENEW Coordinator

Duong Trong Hue

Project Officer

Tel: 053.858 445; Fax: 053.858442

email: hueRENEW@yahoo.com

website: www.vietnam-landmines.org

Approved by

Hoàng ng Mai

Acting director of Quang Tri DoFA

Chuck Searcy

Representative of VVMF Vietnam

Abbreviations:

PACCOM: People's Aid Coordination Committee

MoD: Ministry of Defense

DoFA: Department of Foreign Affairs (Quang Tri Province)

RENEW: Restoring the land for the use of the Vietnamese people through Education and Neutralization of the Effects of the War.

ANNEX 2: EVALUATION AGENDA

EVALUATION AGENDA FOR FIELD WORK RENEW PROJECT February 2004

Time	Activity	Place and person in charge
17/2	<i>Evaluation team leave Hanoi for Quang Tri</i>	
18/2		
Morning	Working in provincial coordination office	
8.00-10.00	Interview project coordination and officers	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
10.00- 11.30	Interview representative of Quang Tri DoFA	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
Afternoon	Working in province	
14.00-16.00	Interview Quang Tri television	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
16:00-17:30	Interview representative of health service	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
19/2	Working in Trieu Phong district	
8.00-10.00	Interview representative of district PC	Dr. Thien
10.00- 10.30	Interview representative of district women union	Dr. Phuong
10.00-11.00	Interview representative of district Peasant association	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
11:00 –12:00	Visit households – project beneficiaries in Ai Tu	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
13:30-14:30	Interview representative of district health center	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
14:30-15:30	Interview district military staff	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
15:00 – 16:00	Interview representative of provincial youth union	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
19:00-21:30	Interview project coordination and officers (continue)	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
20/2		
Morning	Working in Trieu Thuong commune	
8:00-9:00	Interview representative of Trieu Thuong Youth union	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
9:00 –10:00	Interview representative of Trieu Thuong PC	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong

Time	Activity	Place and person in charge
		Mr. Thanh
10:00-11:00	Group discussion of pupils in Trieu Thuong primary school	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
11:00-12:00	Visiting project beneficiaries in Trieu Thuong commune	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
<i>Afternoon</i>	Working in Trieu Hoa commune	
13:30-14:30	Interview representatives of commune PC, YU, Peasant Association, WU	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
14:30 –15:30	Group discussion of pupils in Trieu Hoa primary school	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
15:30-17:30	Visit households – project beneficiaries in Trieu Hoa	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
21/2		
<i>Morning</i>	Working in Trieu Dong commune	
8.00-9.00	Interview CHS staff in Trieu Dong	Bs. Thien Bs. Phuong KS Thanh
9.00- 10.00	Group discussion of families involving in mushroom growing program	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
10:00-11:00	Group discussion of youth people	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
11:00-11:30	Visiting households involving in mushroom activity but not receive project	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
11:30-12:30	Interview village health workers	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Thanh
<i>Afternoon</i>	Working in province: Evaluation team analyse data and discuss on primary findings	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong

Time	Activity	Place and person in charge
22/2		
	Working in province: Evaluation team analyse data and discuss on primary findings (continue)	Dr Thien Dr Phuong
	Interview project office in charge in MRE and MVA	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
	Discuss on Evaluation findings with PACCOM evaluator	
23/2		
	Feedback between evaluation team and authorities of provincial and, RENEW project officers and representative of VVMF	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong Mr. Huong
	Interview representative of VVMF	Dr. Thien Dr. Phuong
	Evaluation team leave Quang Tri for Hanoi	